# 1 Electrical conductivity of the Lithosphere-Asthenosphere System

2 Samer Naif, Kate Selway, Benjamin S. Murphy, Gary Egbert, Anne Pommier

## 3 **1. Introduction**

Electromagnetic geophysical methods image the electrical conductivity of the subsurface.
Electrical conductivity is an intrinsic material property that is sensitive to temperature,
composition, porosity, volatile and/or melt content, and other physical properties relevant
to the solid Earth. Therefore, imaging the electrical structure of the crust and mantle yields
valuable information on the physical and chemical state of the lithosphere-asthenosphere
system.

- 10 Here we explore the viability of the passive magnetotelluric (MT) method for constraining
- 11 upper mantle properties. We approach this problem in four successive steps: 1) review the
- 12 electrical conductivity behavior of relevant materials; 2) predict the bulk electrical
- 13 conductivity structure of oceanic and continental lithosphere for a suite of representative
- 14 physical states; 3) generate synthetic MT data from the conductivity predictions; 4) compare
- and discuss the conductivity predictions and the synthetic data with select case studies from
- 16 oceanic and continental settings. Our aim is to clarify the uncertainties associated with 17 drawing inferences from electrical conductivity observations and ultimately to provide a
- basis for assigning confidence levels to interpretations.

# 19 **2. Electrical conductivity of Earth's materials**

Electrical conductivity (EC) is a measure of a material's ability to conduct electric current and has SI units of siemens per meter [S/m]. It is the reciprocal of electrical resistivity—a material's ability to resist the flow of electric current (SI units of ohm-meters,  $[\Omega \cdot m]$ ). Throughout this review, we frequently switch between referring to conductivity and resistivity. Most of the equations use EC units (Section 3 on the MT method is the exception). However, we stick to the convention of quoting the resistivity values in order to make direct comparisons with the MT data in later sections.

- The EC of a material is governed by the net flux of charge carriers, which may consist of multiple carrier species each acting as a separate conduction mechanism
- 29

$$\sigma_i = c_i q_i \mu_i \tag{1}$$

- 30 where the index *i* denotes the *i*th species,  $\sigma_i$  is the EC due to the flux of the *i*th species,  $c_i$  is
- 31 its charge concentration,  $q_i$  is its effective particle charge, and  $\mu_i$  is its charge carrier mobility.
- 32 The EC of a material is the cumulative sum of all conduction mechanisms operating, although
- 33 it is common for a single mechanism to dominate for a given thermal regime.
- 34 In electrolyte solutions and semiconductors, the flux of charge carriers is physically related
- 35 to a diffusion process, per Einstein's relation describing Brownian motion

$$D_i = \frac{\mu_i k_B T}{q_i} \tag{2}$$

37 where  $D_i$  is the diffusivity of the *i*th species,  $k_B$  is the Boltzmann's constant, and *T* is the 38 absolute temperature. Rearranging Eq. 2 and substituting into Eq. 1 yields the Nernst-39 Einstein relation

40

$$\sigma_i = \frac{D_i c_i q_i^2}{k_B T} \tag{3}$$

which is an expression that can be used to predict the EC of a particular charge carrier
species *i* from its self-diffusivity and vice versa (e.g., Mott & Gurney, 1948; Misener, 1974;
Karato, 1990).

44 Three major categories describe the electrical behavior of materials: insulators, 45 semiconductors, and conductors. For example, at ambient pressure-temperature (P-T) conditions, graphite is a conductor ( $\sim 10^{-5} \Omega \cdot m$ ) and quartz is an insulator ( $\sim 10^{15} \Omega \cdot m$ ) (e.g., 46 47 Tyburczy & Fisler, 1995). The pair are electrical endmembers that differ by a staggering 20 48 orders of magnitude. Yet the majority of naturally occurring minerals in Earth's crust and 49 mantle are semiconductors that exhibit overlapping EC values (Fig 1). More importantly, the 50 crust and mantle are compositionally heterogeneous while electromagnetic (EM) soundings 51 provide a bulk measurement of EC that represents a volume average of the aggregate of 52 constituent materials. Secondary phases such as metal oxides/sulfides, aqueous solutions, 53 and molten silicates can be several orders of magnitude more conductive than their host 54 rock. As a result, the bulk EC may be controlled by small amounts of highly conductive 55 materials when they form interconnected networks. Indeed, nearly all EM observations of 56 the crust and upper mantle are confined to a relatively narrow band of  $0.1-10^6 \Omega \cdot m$ . Note that in the specific case of the MT method, the absence of highly resistive anomalies greater 57 58 than ~10<sup>4</sup>  $\Omega$ ·m is due to a lack of data sensitivity to insulators (see Section 4.1.1). It is 59 therefore crucial to consider the ambiguity inherent in inferring the physical state from EC 60 observations even in the case of perfectly known subsurface electric structure.



61

76

62 Figure 1: The electrical conductivity (EC) of representative Earth materials. Freshwater EC is

63 calculated at 20 % as a function of practical salinity units (psu); seawater is 35 psu and drinking water 64 is <0.5 psu. Marine sediment and oceanic crust EC are calculated with 20 % seawater. Hydrated upper

65 mantle EC is calculated at 1200  $^\circ$ C as a function of water content. Mafic melt EC is calculated as a

function of temperature for anhydrous melt (black) and as a function of water content at  $1200 \,^{\circ}$  for 66

hydrous melt (blue). Partial melt EC is calculated at  $1200 \, \text{C}$  as a function of porosity for anhydrous 67

(black) and hydrous mafic melt with 2 wt% water (blue). See Section 2 for details. Colorbar shows 68

typical scale used to plot MT inversion. 69

#### 70 2.1 Conduction in solids

71 Naturally occurring crystalline materials, including silicate minerals, are predominantly 72 semiconductors that host charge carriers in the form of intrinsic point defects and extrinsic 73 impurities in the crystal lattice. Since the mobility of charge carriers is thermally activated. 74 the EC is proportional to temperature and can be described in the form of an Arrhenius 75 equation (Arrhenius, 1889)

$$\sigma = \sum_{i} \sigma_{0,i} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta E_i}{k_B T}\right) \tag{4}$$

where  $\sigma_{0,i}$  is the pre-exponential factor of the *i*th species and  $\Delta E_i$  is its activation energy. 77 78 Note that since the Nernst-Einstein relation (Eq. 3) is a function of the diffusivity, it also has 79 the exponential behavior seen in Eq. 4 since the diffusivity itself depends on the mobility (per 80 Eq. 2). Furthermore, in addition to the mobility, the concentration of charge carriers can also 81 be a thermally activated quantity. The EC of a material is also sensitive to pressure, in which 82 case the activation enthalpy is a more meaningful quantity than activation energy 83

$$\Delta H = \Delta E + P \Delta V \tag{5}$$

84 where  $\Delta H$  is the activation enthalpy, *P* is the pressure, and  $\Delta V$  is the activation volume. A 85 positive activation volume will reduce the EC with increasing pressure.

The mantle is predominantly composed of ferromagnesian silicate minerals, all nominally anhydrous minerals (NAMs). The upper mantle commonly has modal proportions of 50– 90% olivine, 10–40% pyroxene, and 0–20% garnet (e.g., Griffin et al., 2009). Although a variety of point defect populations exist in ferromagnesian NAMs (e.g., Smyth & Stocker, 1975), only three are considered to be important conduction mechanisms in the upper mantle (e.g., Schock & Duba, 1985)

$$\sigma = \sigma_{\rm Mg} + \sigma_{\rm Fe} + \sigma_{\rm H} \tag{6}$$

93 where subscript 'Mg' represents magnesium vacancy diffusion (ionic conduction), subscript

94 'Fe' represents electron exchange between ferric and ferrous iron (small polaron hopping), 95 and subscript 'H' represents hydrogen diffusion in water-bearing minerals (proton conduction) (see Yoshino (2010) for schematic diagrams of all three conduction 96 97 mechanisms). Because pressure typically has a small effect on EC relative to temperature 98 (e.g., Xu et al., 2000), it is not uncommon in the literature to implicitly assume  $\Delta V = 0$  and 99 thereby assume  $\Delta E$  to mean  $\Delta H$  (e.g., Gardés et al., 2014). However, constraining the effect 100 of pressure on EC is important to develop accurate electrical models that span large pressure 101 (depth) ranges, particularly at higher temperatures prevalent in the asthenosphere where

102 the conduction mechanism expected to dominate for that thermal regime ( $\sigma_{Mg}$ ) may have a

103 significant activation volume in olivine (e.g., Yoshino et al., 2017; Fei et al., 2018; 2020).

#### 104 **2.1.1 Anhydrous conduction**

105 A prominent thermally activated conduction mechanism is the creation and migration of 106 ionic vacancies in the crystal lattice. The most relevant intrinsic charge carriers in upper 107 mantle NAMs are magnesium cation vacancies. Their contribution to conductivity is 108 approximated by

109 
$$\sigma_{\rm Mg} = \sigma_{0,\rm Mg} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta H_{\rm Mg}}{k_B T}\right) \tag{7}$$

110 where the pre-exponential factor  $\sigma_{0,Mg}$  is a constant.

111 Another prominent conduction mechanism in iron-bearing NAMs is small polaron hopping.

- 112 Electronic conduction via small polaron hopping is a byproduct of iron substituting for
- 113 magnesium at a cation site. Iron can take on the form of either a ferrous ( $Fe^{2+}$ ) or ferric ( $Fe^{3+}$ )
- 114 ion. The excess positive charge in  $Fe^{3+}$  is a result of an electron hole, and it is the transfer (or
- 115 "hopping") of electron holes between  $Fe^{3+}$  and  $Fe^{2+}$  that is responsible for the conduction
- 116 (Hirsch et al., 1993). The hopping flux—and hence its contribution to EC—peaks when the
- 117 proportions of  $Fe^{3+}$  and  $Fe^{2+}$  are equivalent.

- 118 At a fixed composition, the speciation of iron is indicative of the in situ oxygen fugacity and
- 119 is governed by thermodynamics (see Frost (1991) for an introduction to oxygen fugacity).
- 120 Although some amount of Fe<sup>3+</sup> is present in NAMs at the oxygen fugacity and temperature
- 121 conditions prevalent in the upper mantle,  $Fe^{2+}$  is much more abundant in these minerals
- 122 because it substitutes a divalent magnesium  $(Mg^{2+})$  in an Mg site and maintains charge
- 123 neutrality (Yoshino, 2010). Hence, the concentration of  $Fe^{3+}$  is the limiting agent in small
- 124 polaron conduction. Since the proportion of  $Fe^{3+}$  tends to increase with increasing oxygen
- 125 fugacity, the flux of small polaron charge carriers depends on both the total iron content and
- 126 the oxygen fugacity

133

127 
$$\sigma_{\rm Fe} = \sigma_{0,\rm Fe} X_{\rm Fe} f_{0_2}^{q} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta H_{\rm Fe}}{k_B T}\right)$$
(8)

128 where  $X_{\text{Fe}}$  is the mole fraction of iron,  $f_{0_2}$  is the oxygen fugacity, and exponent q is a constant.

Several studies have noted that an increasing iron content reduces the Fe<sup>2+</sup>–Fe<sup>3+</sup> hopping distance, which should reduce the activation enthalpy (e.g., Seifert et al., 1982; Romano et al.,

130 distance, which should reduce the activation enthalpy (e.g., Sener (e.g., Sener (e.g., 1902, Romano et al.,

131 2006). Yoshino & Katsura (2009) proposed using an *n*-type semiconductor model to

approximate the effect of iron content on the activation enthalpy

$$\Delta H_{\rm Fe} = \Delta H_{0,\rm Fe} - \alpha_{\rm Fe} X_{\rm Fe}^{1/3} \tag{9}$$

134 where  $\Delta H_{0,Fe}$  is the activation enthalpy at diminishing iron content and  $\alpha_{Fe}$  is a constant.

- 135 On average, the upper mantle is thought to have an oxygen fugacity that falls within a few log
- 136 units of the quartz-fayalite-magnetite (QFM) buffer as well as a relatively fixed iron content
- 137 of  $X_{\text{Fe}} \approx 0.09-0.11$  (Frost & McMammon, 2008). By treating both  $X_{\text{Fe}}$  and  $f_{0_2}$  as constants,
- 138 we can incorporate both terms into the pre-exponential factor  $\sigma_{0,\text{Fe}}$  and simplify Eq. 8 into

139 
$$\sigma_{\rm Fe} = \sigma_{0,\rm Fe} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta H_{\rm Fe}}{k_B T}\right) \tag{10}$$

In the absence of hydration, holding the iron content and oxygen fugacity fixed implies that temperature alone controls mantle conductivity since it is the only remaining free variable in Eq. 7 and Eq. 10. In NAMs, small polaron hopping is likely the dominant conduction mechanism in anhydrous upper mantle for colder temperatures (<1300°C) since it has a lower activation enthalpy ( $\Delta E_{\rm Fe} \sim 1.3 - 1.7 \text{ eV}$ ) than magnesium vacancy diffusion ( $\Delta E_{\rm Mg} > 2 \text{ eV}$ ) (Schock et al., 1989; Hirsch et al., 1993; Constable & Roberts, 1997).

### 146 **2.1.2 Hydrous conduction**

- 147 Hydrogen is an extrinsic ionic impurity and one of the fastest diffusing charge carriers in
- 148 NAMs (Kohlstedt & Mackwell, 1998; Ferriss et al., 2016; Reynes et al., 2018). Based on the
- 149 Nernst-Einstein relation (Eq. 3), hydrogen is predicted to enhance EC due to its high mobility
- 150 (Karato, 1990). Indeed, a growing body of experimental studies have all confirmed a
- 151 significant EC enhancement for hydrogen-doped NAMs (e.g., Wang et al., 2006; Yoshino et

al., 2006; 2009; Poe et al., 2010; Dai & Karato, 2014; Dai et al., 2020). Therefore, since
hydrogen (commonly referred to as "water") is prevalent in the mantle at regionally variable
concentrations (e.g., Li et al., 2008; Kelley et al., 2019), EC observations provide a means to
infer bulk mantle water content.

Two distinct forms of the Arrhenius equation have been proposed to account for the effect of hydrogen on EC. The first employs the *n*-type semiconductor model seen in Eq. 9, but in this case considers the effect of hydrogen content on activation enthalpy (Yoshino et al., 2009)

160 
$$\sigma_{\rm H} = \sigma_{0,\rm H} C_{\rm w} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta H_{\rm H} - \alpha C_{\rm w}^{1/3}}{k_B T}\right) \tag{11}$$

161 where  $C_w$  is the water content in wt%. In contrast, the second form assumes no activation 162 enthalpy dependence on total water content and instead considers hydrogen speciation, or 163 the mechanism by which hydrogen is incorporated into the crystal lattice and enhances 164 conductivity (Wang et al., 2006)

165 
$$\sigma_{\rm H} = \sigma_{0,\rm H} C_{\rm w}^r \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta H_{\rm H}}{k_B T}\right) \tag{12}$$

where the exponent r is a constant whose value depends on the hydrogen speciation. When r = 1, all of the hydrogen protons are incorporated and contributing to EC. In this scenario,

168 the EC value determined from in situ measurements would match the EC value predicted by

169 the Nernst-Einstein relation (Eq. 3), since the latter is calculated using the self-diffusivity and

170 total concentration of hydrogen.

- 171 Regardless of which Arrhenius form is applied (Eq. 11 or Eq. 12) and/or the origin of the 172 conduction mechanism, there are significant discrepancies between the in situ EC 173 measurements on hydrated olivine from independent laboratory groups (e.g., Yoshino & 174 Katsura, 2013; Karato, 2013; Gardés et al., 2014; and references cited in Fig 2). Yet another 175 noteworthy discrepancy is in the activation enthalpy ( $\Delta H_{\rm H}$ ) of olivine determined from in 176 situ EC (~0.9 eV) and isotope diffusion measurements (~1.3–2.1 eV; Du Frane & Tyburczy, 177 2012; Novella et al., 2017; Sun et al., 2019), which is a source of ongoing debate on whether 178 this reflects distinct isotope diffusion and electrical conduction mechanisms and, hence, the 179 validity of applying the Nernst-Einstein relation to predict the EC for hydrated olivine (e.g., 180 Karato, 2013; 2015; Jones, 2016; Sun et al., 2019). In practice, these discrepancies hinder 181 attempts to infer precisely the concentration of mantle water from MT observations. To 182 illustrate this, Figure 2a shows the EC predictions as a function of water content from several 183 competing olivine models at 1200°C. For 100  $\Omega$ ·m mantle, the water content estimates vary 184 by two orders of magnitude (7–800 ppm  $H_2O$ ). This uncertainty is significantly reduced, to 185 about half an order of magnitude (60–300 ppm  $H_2O$ ), when only the most recent model from
- 186 each laboratory group is considered (in effect excluding W06 and Y09). It is not

187 unreasonable to assume that this uncertainty reduction is in part due to technical 188 advancements that allow more accurate EC measurements for hydrous minerals. Therefore, 189 our hydrous mantle EC calculations in Section 4, which adopt W06 and Y09, represent a 190 'worst-case' scenario and potentially overstate this uncertainty.

191 Relatively few experimental studies have investigated the EC of other NAMs under hydrous 192 conditions. Competing models for pyrope-rich garnet (Dai & Karato, 2009a; Dai et al., 2012) 193 and orthopyroxene (Dai & Karato, 2009b; Schlechter et al., 2012; Zhang et al., 2012) also 194 show large EC differences (Fig 2b). This is particularly so for garnet, since the D09a model is 195 significantly more conductive than all of the NAM models considered here. Dai et al. (2012) 196 measured the EC of a garnet sample of identical chemical composition to that used in D09a 197 and, as expected, the results are equivalent under dry conditions. However, at 465 ppm H<sub>2</sub>O 198 (the only water content considered), the results are around seven times less conductive than 199 D09a. Since Dai et al. (2012) did not give an empirical model for garnet EC as a function of 200 water content, we provide one here based on the Dai & Karato (2014) formulation for olivine,

201 which also only measured EC at a single hydration level

202

$$\sigma_{\rm H} = \sigma_0 \left(\frac{C_{\rm w}}{C_{\rm w,0}}\right)' \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta H}{k_B T}\right) \tag{13}$$

203 where  $C_{w,0}$  is the water content at the reference state (465 ppm in this case) and r = 0.63

per D09a. The resulting model (D12), shown in Fig 2b, has similar behavior to D09a except
 that it is more resistive.

206 The source(s) of the experimental disagreement remains unclear, although possible culprits 207 include inaccurate water content measurements, sample dehydration during experimental 208 runs, grain boundary effects in polycrystalline samples, and/or nonuniform hydration or 209 chemical zonation of the starting sample (e.g., Gardés et al., 2014; Jones, 2016). The largest 210 potential source of error is likely water content measurements using Fourier Transform 211 Infrared (FTIR) spectroscopy. Conductivity studies that use unpolarized light often apply the 212 Paterson (1982) calibration to determine the water content, but this approach is prone to 213 introducing nonsystematic errors (Libowitzky & Rossman, 1996) and has been shown to 214 underestimate water in NAMs by as much as a factor of 3–3.5 (Bell et al., 1995; 2003). This 215 has significant implications for the EC models of hydrous minerals and has been proposed 216 as an explanation for the lab discrepancies (Poe et al., 2010; Gardés et al., 2014). 217 Unfortunately, recalibrating unpolarized FTIR measurements is nonlinear and requires 218 sample-specific details in addition to the raw spectra, which were not documented in prior 219 studies. Therefore, throughout this review, we use the EC models in their original form without applying any corrections. This is likely to mean that we are overestimating the effect 220 221 of hydration on mantle conductivity, and as such our hydrous mantle EC models should be 222 considered upper bound estimates (Naif, 2018). We encourage future experimental studies

- to document the necessary details that allow applying newer and more accurate calibrations
- as they become available.



225

226 Figure 2: Electrical conductivity of NAMs as a function of water content at 1200°C. (a) EC models for 227 olivine [W06-Wang et al., 2006; Y09-Yoshino et al., 2009; P10-Poe et al., 2010; J12-Jones et al., 2012; 228 D14-Dai & Karato, 2014; UHO-Gardés et al., 2014; N17-Novella et al., 2017; S19-Sun et al., 2019]. The 229 solid lines are models from in situ EC measurements and dashed lines from isotope self-diffusion 230 measurements. The colored arrows mark the water content at 100  $\Omega$ ·m from each model, which ranges 231 between 7 and 800 ppm  $H_2O$ . (b) EC models for pyrope-rich garnet [D09a-Dai & Karato, 2009a; D12-232 Dai et al., 2012] and orthoenstatite [D09b-Dai & Karato, 2009b; Z12-Zhang et al., 2012]. The D12 model 233 for garnet is our extrapolation from that study's measurement at a single water content (465 ppm), 234 shown by the purple square (see Eq. 13 and text for details). The grey region shows the range of olivine 235 *EC* values from the models in (*a*). Note that all of the model curves in both panels are extrapolations 236 since the experiments were limited to  $1000 \, \text{C}$  or less (1100  $\, \text{C}$  for D14) to avoid sample dehydration.

#### 237 **2.2 Conduction in fluids**

- Although the hydrogen conduction mechanisms are debated for some silicate minerals, ionic
- 239 diffusion is almost always the primary control on EC for liquids due to the abundance and
- 240 high diffusivity of ionic charge carriers in solution. This is true for silicate and carbonate
- 241 melts as well as aqueous solutions consisting of salts dissolved in water.

#### 242 **2.2.1 Aqueous solutions**

- The EC of an aqueous solution is governed by the concentration of ions and their respective mobilities, as per Eq. 1 and Eq. 3. The contribution of a particular solute to the EC depends on the degree to which it dissociates to form free ions when dissolved in water. Furthermore, because the solubility, degree of dissociation, and mobility of a solute all have a nonlinear dependence on the thermodynamic state, the EC behavior of a solution under varying P-T
- 248 conditions is complex.
- 249 Pure water consists of  $H_2O$  molecules in equilibrium with a very small quantity of dissociated
- 250  $H^+$  and  $OH^-$  ions that are highly mobile. It has a resistivity on the order of  $10^5 \Omega \cdot m$  at ambient
- 251 P-T (1 atm, 25°C), which generally increases with rising P-T due to higher degrees of self-
- dissociation (Holzapfel, 1969). However, pure water does not exist in nature given its
- 253 potency as a solvent. Freshwater has enough ions in solution that its EC is enhanced by two
- to four orders of magnitude. Indeed, EC is so sensitive to the total concentration of ions in
- 255 dilute solutions that it is routinely used to test for mineral content and drinking water quality
- 256 (e.g., Sappa et al., 2014).
- For crustal scale EM studies involving aqueous fluids in porous media, the EC of the fluid is typically estimated from experimental data on sodium chloride (NaCl) solutions as that is the most abundant salt present in the water and the mobility of other common ionic species is of similar magnitude (Nesbitt, 1993). For example, mean seawater has about 3.5 wt% dissolved salts, of which 1.9 wt% is Cl<sup>-</sup> and 1.1 wt% is Na<sup>+</sup> ions.
- Recent advancements have significantly increased the range of P-T conditions under which EC measurements on saline fluids are possible, from 0.4 GPa and 800°C (e.g., Quist & Marshall, 1968) to 5 GPa and 900°C (Guo & Keppler, 2019). Sinmyo & Keppler (2017) developed the following equation to fit their data with a linear regression

266 
$$\log \sigma_f = A_1 + A_2/T + A_3 \log c + A_4 \log \varrho + \log \Lambda_0$$
(14)

267

$$\Lambda_0 = \lambda_1 + \lambda_2 + \lambda_3/T + \lambda_4/T^2 \tag{15}$$

268 where  $A_i$  are constants, T is the absolute temperature, c is the NaCl concentration in wt%,  $\rho$ 269 is the density of pure water in g/cm<sup>3</sup> (at given P-T),  $A_0$  is the molar conductivity at infinite 270 dilution in S·cm<sup>2</sup>/mol (at given P-T), and  $\lambda_i$  are constants. Although small fractions of highly 271 saline fluids can readily explain most EC observations, the chemical and mechanical stability 272 of pore fluids at depth is debated (e.g., Yardley & Valley, 1997; 2000; Wannamaker, 2000)

- and must be considered if they are to be invoked as a cause for conductive anomalies, which
- is beyond the scope of this review.

### 275 **2.2.2 Molten silicates and carbonates**

- As is the case for aqueous solutions, the EC of molten minerals is also governed by the concentration and mobility of the various ionic species but where the bulk chemistry plays a critical role (e.g., composition, amount of alkali, degree of polymerization, concentration of volatiles dissolved in the melt). Here we briefly describe the EC dependence of carbonated hydrous silicate melt, specifically mafic (basaltic) melts as they are most relevant to the asthenosphere. We refer the reader to previous reviews of melt conductivity for more insight on the electrical behavior of other silicate melts (e.g., Pommier, 2014; Ni et al., 2015; Yoshino,
- **283 2018).**
- Anhydrous basaltic melts are several orders of magnitude more conductive than their source rock (Rai & Manghnani, 1977; Tyburczy & Waff, 1983). The addition of water further enhances the EC by around one order of magnitude (Ni et al., 2011). Yet hydrous basaltic melts are still two to three orders of magnitude less conductive than carbonatite melts (Yoshino et al., 2010; Sifré et al., 2014). The significant effect of both H<sub>2</sub>O and CO<sub>2</sub> on the conductivity of carbonated hydrous basaltic melts is expressed in the semi-empirical relationship of Sifré et al. (2014)

291 
$$\sigma_{\text{melt}} = \sigma_{\text{H}_2\text{O}} + \sigma_{\text{CO}_2} = \sigma_{0,\text{H}_2\text{O}} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta E_{\text{H}_2\text{O}}}{RT}\right) + \sigma_{0,\text{CO}_2} \exp\left(-\frac{\Delta E_{\text{CO}_2}}{RT}\right)$$
(16)

where the activation energy and pre-exponential factor of each volatile species ( $H_2O$  and  $CO_2$ ) depends on its concentration

294

$$\Delta E_{\text{volatile}} = a \exp(-bC_{\text{volatile}}) + c \tag{17}$$

$$\ln \sigma_{0,\mathrm{volatile}} = d\Delta E_{\mathrm{volatile}} + e$$

where *a*, *b*, *c*, *d*, and *e* are constants and  $C_{\text{volatile}}$  is the H<sub>2</sub>O or CO<sub>2</sub> content in wt%.

### 297 **2.3 Conduction in multi-phase media**

Our capability to model the physical properties (such as EC) of the Earth's crust and mantle directly depends on our understanding of its mineralogy, thermal state, and pore fluid content. At a defined temperature, the bulk EC of a multi-phase assemblage strongly depends on the geometry and interconnectivity of each phase, especially when one is much more conductive than the other(s). Several formalisms, such as the commonly used Archie's law and Hashin-Shtrikman (HS) bounds, have been proposed and reviewed in detail elsewhere (e.g., Glover et al., 2000; ten Grotenhuis et al., 2005; Glover, 2010; Miller et al., 2015).

305 An isolated phase present in a small amount is unlikely to contribute significantly to the bulk

306 EC, even if its intrinsic conductivity is high. In order to be detected by EM methods such as

307 MT, a high-conductivity phase needs to be interconnected over some finite region that is

(18)

308 large enough to influence the data. This configuration is expected in geological contexts

309 where fluids are present, such as at volcanic areas (e.g., Müller & Haak, 2004; Aizawa et al.,

310 2014; Pommier et al., 2010; Bedrosian et al., 2018), mantle upwelling zones (e.g.,

311 Wannamaker et al., 2008; Comeau et al., 2018), mid-ocean ridges (e.g., Caricchi et al., 2011;

312 Key et al., 2013; Johansen et al., 2019), and subduction zones (e.g., Worzewski et al., 2011;

313 McGary et al., 2014; Laumonier et al., 2015; Heise et al., 2017).

#### 314 2.3.1 Multi-phase porous media

The simplest mixtures consist of two phases: a porous solid saturated in fluid. The routinely used Hashin-Shtrikman formulation provides theoretical bounds on the EC of homogeneous

317 isotropic mixtures (Hashin & Shtrikman, 1962). It assumes a volume packed with spheres

318 where the outer shell of each sphere is made up of one phase and the core of the other phase.

319 For the upper bound (HS<sup>+</sup>), the outer shell is the conductive phase and the core is the

320 resistive phase, and vice versa for the lower bound (HS<sup>-</sup>)

321 
$$\sigma_{\text{bulk}}^{HS^+} = \sigma_c \left[ 1 - \frac{3\phi_r(\sigma_c - \sigma_r)}{3\sigma_c - \phi_c(\sigma_c - \sigma_r)} \right]$$
(19)

322 
$$\sigma_{\text{bulk}}^{HS^-} = \sigma_r \left[ 1 + \frac{3\phi_c(\sigma_c - \sigma_r)}{3\sigma_r + \phi_r(\sigma_c - \sigma_r)} \right]$$
(20)

323 where  $\sigma_c$  and  $\phi_c$  are the EC value and the volume fraction of the conductive phase and  $\sigma_r$  and 324  $\phi_r$  are the EC value and volume fraction of the resistive phase, respectively.

In cases where the fluid is several orders of magnitude more conductive than the host rock, the fluid conductivity and the porosity can be used to estimate the bulk EC. One such widely applied empirical relationship is Archie's law (Archie, 1942)

328

$$\sigma_{\text{bulk}} = \sigma_f \phi^m \tag{21}$$

where  $\sigma_f$  is the fluid conductivity,  $\phi$  is the porosity (volume fraction), and *m* is the 329 330 empirically derived Archie's exponent. In practice, the observed quantity is the bulk EC and 331 the desired quantity is either the porosity or pore fluid conductivity. Archie's law was 332 developed specifically for porous media with relatively uniform pore geometries such as 333 unconsolidated sediments and sedimentary rocks. It has also been successfully applied to 334 fractured crustal rocks (e.g., Brace & Orange, 1968; Becker, 1985; Key et al., 2012) and 335 partially molten rocks (e.g., Miller et al., 2015). A significant advantage of Archie's law is the 336 flexibility afforded by the exponent variable *m*. A commonly used value is m = 2, with most 337 applications adopting values between 1.5–2.5 and slightly higher in carbonates (Glover, 338 2010). However, Archie's law cannot be applied universally in its original form. Numerous 339 variants have been proposed for specialized cases, such as for clay-bearing mixtures where a unique surface conduction process operates (e.g., Waxman & Smits, 1968). 340

341 There are also mixing models for more than two phases. The geometric mean is commonly

342 used for randomly distributed mixtures

343 
$$\sigma_{\text{bulk}} = \prod_{i} \sigma_{i}^{\phi_{i}}$$
(22)

where  $\sigma_i$  is the EC of the *i*th phase and exponent  $\phi_i$  is the volume fraction of the *i*th phase. Alternatively, Archie's law has been generalized to accommodate any number of phases and geometrical constraints on the distribution (Glover, 2010)

347 
$$\sigma_{\text{bulk}} = \sum_{i} \sigma_i \phi_i^{m_i}$$
(23)

348 
$$m_j = \frac{\log(1 - \sum_{i \neq j} \phi_i^{m_i})}{\log(1 - \sum_{i \neq j} \phi_i)}$$
(24)

As is the case for the conventional form of Archie's law in Eq. 21, the Archie's exponent is a variable that provides valuable flexibility for tailoring to specific applications. However,

351 since the *m* values for systems with three or more conducting phases such as mantle rocks

352 have relatively few constraints, this flexibility is also a source of uncertainty.

#### 353 **2.3.2 Multi-phase mantle**

- 354 When the difference in EC values is small or moderate for all phases that make up the 355 aggregate, it is tempting to simplify the system by assuming that, to first approximation, the 356 bulk EC corresponds to the conductivity of the most abundant phase. However, this 357 simplification may lead to a significant bias in physical property estimates that can be 358 deduced from electrical measurements. For instance, EC models of the Earth's upper mantle 359 often assume an olivine-only mineralogy, olivine being both the most abundant mineral in 360 this part of the mantle and the most widely measured in conductivity experiments. Recent 361 studies demonstrate this simplification of mantle chemistry has significant effects on the 362 interpretation of bulk mantle EC observations and that accurate estimations require 363 incorporating a more realistic petrology (e.g., Fullea et al., 2011; Khan, 2016; Naif, 2018; 364 Selway et al., 2019; Özaydin & Selway, 2020). Below we provide a working example of how 365 composition affects mantle temperature.
- Xenoliths have shown that olivine, pyroxene, and garnet are all present in significant amounts in the upper mantle (e.g., Stachel et al., 2005). Let us consider a typical peridotite composition for the convecting asthenosphere with 55 vol% olivine, 25 vol% pyroxene, and 20 vol% garnet. Using the EC studies for each phase, we computed the bulk EC of the
- 370 corresponding bulk mantle over 900–1400°C. For each temperature, calculations were
- performed using Eq. 22 for the geometric mean (e.g., Shankland & Duba, 1990). However, if
- 372 we consider a rock with isolated garnet grains (i.e., not interconnected; Boullier & Nicolas,
- 1975), using the geometric mean overestimates the influence of garnet on the bulk EC. This
- 374 is evident when applying the generalized Archie's law in Eq. 23 to more "realistically" predict
- the bulk EC. Taking the Archie's exponent of pyroxene and garnet to be 1.3 and 5, Eq. 24
- 376 requires  $m \sim 0.3$  for olivine. The results are presented in Figure 3.



377

378 Figure 3: Effect of mantle chemistry, water distribution, and geometric mixing models on electrical 379 conductivity. Grey lines are for dry mantle and colored lines for 200 ppm water. Dotted lines assume an 380 olivine-only composition, while dashed and solid correspond to a mixture of 55 vol% olivine, 25 vol% 381 pyroxene, and 20 vol% garnet. Water partition coefficient for pyroxene/olivine (D=10) and 382 garnet/olivine (D=2) are from Hauri et al. (2006). Model curves calculated with Eq. 22 (dashed lines) 383 use the geometric mean mixing model, while those using Eq. 23 (solid lines) use the generalized Archie's 384 law formulation with Archie's exponent values of 1.3 and 5 for pyroxene and garnet. Colored arrows 385 indicate the temperature uncertainties that result from considering different EC models and geometric 386 mixing models. The grey area represents the "forbidden zone" of physically unrealizable resistivity-387 temperature combinations. See text for details.

For an anhydrous ("dry") mixture, the EC difference between an olivine-only mantle and the geometric mean of a three-phase mantle is moderate, equivalent to about 60°C uncertainty for 100  $\Omega$ ·m mantle (Fig 3). This is because dry garnet is approximately half an order of magnitude more conductive than orthopyroxene and one order of magnitude more conductive than olivine (Dai & Karato, 2009a; Dai et al., 2012; note that other laboratory studies found garnet to be only slightly more conductive than olivine, e.g., Romano et al., 2006). By comparison, the difference is small for the generalized Archie's law calculation 395 since it downweighs the influence of garnet. This makes it tempting to justify the application

- 396 of an olivine-only mineralogy when estimating the EC of dry mantle. However, the Archie's
- 397 exponents are not fixed quantities and are often poorly known (e.g., Glover et al., 2000;

398 Laumonier et al., 2017). Therefore, given the increasing availability of EC values for different

399 minerals and the relative simplicity of generating multi-phase models, we suggest always

- 400 comparing the olivine-only dry mantle conductivity with more realistic mixtures to justify
- using the former. 401
- 402 For a wet mantle, moderate to large EC differences are predicted depending on the 403 mineralogy (olivine-only or mixture of minerals), the water distribution between the 404 different minerals, and the choice of EC models. Let us consider the UHO (olivine), Z12 405 (orthopyroxene), and D12 (garnet) conductivity models as well as a bulk mantle water 406 content of 200 ppm, which is consistent with estimates for mid-ocean ridge basalt (MORB) 407 source in the upper mantle (50–250 ppm) from previous studies (e.g., Saal et al., 2002; 408 Hirschmann, 2006). When accounting for water partitioning values (using partition coefficients  $D_{\text{pyx/ol}} = 10$  and  $D_{\text{gt/ol}} = 2$ ; from Hauri et al., 2006), the olivine, garnet, and 409 410 pyroxene have about 58, 116, and 580 ppm water, respectively. In this example, the choice 411 of mixing model has a moderate effect on the mantle temperature estimate ( $\sim$ 75°C). At a 412 bulk resistivity value of 100  $\Omega$ ·m, an olivine-only mantle with 200 ppm water (dotted cyan 413 line) yields a temperature estimate of about 1107°C, whereas accounting for composition 414 and water partitioning yields 1123°C for a geometric mean mixture (Eq. 22; dashed cyan 415 line) or 1180°C for a generalized Archie's law mixture (Eq. 23; solid cyan line), i.e., 16°C or 416 73°C higher than for a simplistic mantle chemistry. Note that the hydrous mantle mixtures 417 can be more resistive than the olivine-only resistivity because the olivine phase in the former 418 has only 58 ppm water compared with 200 ppm in the latter.
- 419 The uncertainty has a greater dependence on which EC models are applied than it does on 420 the choice of mixing model. For instance, replacing the UHO model with Y09 for olivine gives 421 the most resistive prediction, increasing the temperature estimate to 1220°C. If instead we 422 replace the UHO, D12, and Z12 models with the most conductive models for olivine (W06), 423 garnet (D09a), and pyroxene (D09b), the temperature estimate decreases to 947°C. These 424 simple calculations highlight the importance of combining geochemical constraints and 425 petrological knowledge with competing EC measurements when interpreting EM 426 observations.
- 427 It should be noted that the formalisms mentioned above do not account explicitly for the
- 428 contribution of grain boundaries to the bulk EC, though grain boundaries can be considered
- 429 as an independent phase with a specific conductivity value (e.g., Roberts & Tyburczy, 1993).
- 430 Their contribution can be significant, especially in natural rocks with fine-grain size where
- 431 impurities are present between grains. Grain boundaries represent fast diffusion pathways
- 432 in polycrystalline materials, and diffusivities can be orders of magnitude faster than through

433 grains (e.g., Dohmen & Milke, 2010). The flux of impurities through a polycrystalline

- 434 aggregate, and the resulting conductivity, depends on the mobility of the diffusing species
- 435 and on its concentration along the fastest pathway (i.e., grain boundaries). Grain boundaries
- 436 are fast pathways for both ionic (e.g., Watson, 2002) and electronic species (e.g., Roberts &
- 437 Tyburczy, 1991). In fine-grained olivine aggregates, electronic conduction usually dominates
- 438 ionic conduction along grain boundaries, due to a much higher concentration of electronic 439 charge carriers in grain boundaries relative to ionic species (with the possible exception of
- 440 protons) (Pommier et al., 2018).
- 441 2.4 The effect of rock deformation on electrical conductivity
- 442 The motion of rigid lithospheric plates relative to the underlying convecting mantle results 443 in the deformation of the asthenosphere. Both experimental and computational 444 investigations have demonstrated that deformed polycrystalline materials develop strong 445 microtextures, characterized by crystallographic preferred orientations of the grains and a 446 preferential distribution of the grain boundaries (e.g., Ghosh & Karki, 2014; Hansen et al., 447 2014; Marquardt et al., 2015). The resulting microstructure affects the bulk electrical properties of deformed materials, and in particular, causes electrical anisotropy. 448
- 449 The few studies performed on melt-bearing sheared samples (Caricchi et al., 2011; Zhang et
- 450 al., 2014; Pommier et al., 2015) observed electrical anisotropy attributed to the preferential
- 451 connectivity of the melt phase in the direction parallel to the main shear direction. In dry,
- 452
- melt-free olivine aggregates with shear strains up to  $\sim$ 7.3 and grain sizes < $\sim$ 15 µm, it has 453 been demonstrated that grain boundaries become the dominant conduction path and that
- 454 grain boundary conduction is electrically anisotropic, as much as a factor of four more
- 455 conductive in the shear direction than normal to the shear plane (Pommier et al., 2018). This
- 456 suggests that the interpretation of EM data in lithospheric shear zones (where grain sizes
- 457 are extremely small) requires considering the effect of rock deformation on the bulk EC in
- 458 addition to the influence of water and/or melt. For coarser grain-size materials, it is likely
- 459 that the EC would be dominated by the intragranular flux of electronic defects (e.g., Roberts
- 460 & Tyburczy, 1993).

#### 2.5 Electrical conductivity and viscosity 461

- 462 One grand challenge that is a nascent area of research for mantle applications is to use 463 electrical conductivity as a proxy for viscosity since water content, temperature, and partial 464 melt content are also primary controls on mantle viscosity (e.g., Hirth & Kohlstedt, 2003). 465 Viscosity is critical for understanding the dynamics of fundamental geologic processes, such 466 as the efficient focusing of mantle melts generated over a wide region as they ascend and 467 erupt in a narrow zone at mid-ocean ridges and volcanic arcs (e.g., Wilson et al., 2014; Sim 468 et al., this issue). A few studies have attempted to estimate melt and mantle viscosity 469 empirically from electrical conductivity (e.g., Pommier et al., 2013; Selway, 2015; Liu &
- 470 Hasterok, 2016; Xu et al., 2018; Selway et al., 2020).

- 471 In basaltic melts, water dissolution significantly decreases viscosity (Persikov et al., 2017)
- 472 and increases conductivity (Ni et al., 2011), suggesting a correlation between both transport
- 473 properties, as previously demonstrated experimentally in other dry silicate melts
- 474 (Grandjean et al., 2007). The effect of hydrogen (and possibly other volatiles) on the viscosity
- 475 and conductivity of silicate melts strongly depends on temperature, species oxidation state,
- 476 and melt polymerization. A better understanding of these transport properties is required
- 477 to understand the magmatic processes that govern present-day mantle dynamics.

## 478 **3. Introduction of MT method**

479 The primary geophysical tool used to image EC of the lithosphere-asthenosphere system is 480 magnetotelluric (MT) method. Here we provide a brief overview of basic concepts. Vozoff 481 (1991) is a classic reference on the MT method, and many additional details can be found in 482 Chave & Jones (2012). The fundamental physical basis for all EM methods is Faraday's law: 483 a time-varying magnetic flux induces an electric field, which can drive currents in a 484 conductor. The MT method is a passive-source geophysical method, relying on natural time 485 variations in magnetic fields impinging on Earth's surface that induce electric currents in the 486 subsurface. At frequencies above 1 Hz, the source fields arise mostly from radiation (in the 487 electrically insulating atmosphere) of EM fields due to lightning. At the lower frequencies 488 that are most relevant to the deeper Earth considered here, sources of magnetic variations 489 lie in the ionosphere and magnetosphere, driven primarily by interactions of Earth's main 490 field with the solar wind, and convection/neutral winds in the conducting ionosphere.

491 The raw data for the MT method are magnetic and electric field time-series. Magnetic field 492 vectors (usually including vertical components) are measured with induction coil or fluxgate 493 magnetometers (e.g., Constable, 2013). Electric fields (two horizontal components) are 494 derived from measurements of electric potential between pairs of buried non-polarizing 495 electrodes, typically separated by  $\sim 100$  m (the larger the separation the higher the signal-496 to-noise ratio). Raw data are transformed to the frequency domain via Fourier transform of 497 a series of short overlapping time windows, and the resulting sequence of Fourier 498 coefficients are used to estimate an impedance tensor  $\mathbf{Z}(f)$  defining a frequency-dependent 499 linear relationship (or transfer function) between horizontal magnetic (*H*) and electric (*E*) components 500

501

$$\boldsymbol{E} = \boldsymbol{Z}(f)\boldsymbol{H} \tag{25}$$

502 Transfer functions (TFs) that relate the vertical and horizontal magnetic field components 503 (often referred to as "Tippers") are also commonly estimated and used in resistivity imaging. 504 In either case, the statistical TF estimation problem is generally solved with robust methods 505 (e.g., Egbert & Booker, 1986), since field data are all too often contaminated with sporadic 506 bursts of noise (e.g., from anthropogenic EM sources). Most often, magnetic data from a

507 simultaneously occupied second site are used as a "remote reference" for noise cancellation

(Gamble et al., 1979). Modern methods for TF estimation are summarized in Egbert (2011)
and more extensively reviewed in Chave (2012).

510 Maxwell's equations in the quasi-static limit describe the physics of EM induction. In this 511 low-frequency limit, where displacement currents can be neglected in comparison to 512 conduction currents, propagation of EM fields in a conductor is described by a diffusion 513 equation. In the simplest case of a uniform or layered one dimensional (1D) Earth, the 514 equations are identical to those used to describe heat conduction. Thus, variations imposed 515 at the surface (as assumed for MT, where sources are external to the Earth) decay 516 exponentially with depth

517 
$$\delta = \sqrt{\frac{\rho T}{\pi \mu_0}} \approx 500 \sqrt{\rho T}$$
(26)

r -

518 where  $\delta$  is the skin depth in meters,  $\rho$  is the resistivity in  $\Omega \cdot m$ , *T* is the period in seconds, and 519  $\mu_0$  is the magnetic permeability of free space (equal to  $4\pi \times 10^{-7}$  H/m). At one skin depth, 520 the field amplitudes at the surface decay to 1/e (*e* being the natural logarithm), or about 521 37%. The dependence of skin depth on period means that lower-frequency signals penetrate 522 more deeply and will be sensitive to deeper structure. As simple examples, the skin depths 523 of a 10  $\Omega \cdot m$  half-space at 10, 100, and 1000 s periods are approximately 5, 16, and 50 km,

respectively. Skin depths at the same periods would be reduced for a less resistive (more

525 conductive) Earth.

526 Controlled-source electromagnetic (CSEM) methods are also used for imaging subsurface EC, 527 often with higher resolution than MT data, but for practical transmitter powers the depth of 528 investigation is limited to the uppermost crust. The marine CSEM method is an exception. In 529 the ocean, the skin depth of seawater is less than 1 km at 10 s period. Therefore, the high-530 frequency EM fields are significantly attenuated, which limits the marine MT data to periods 531 longer than about 20 s in most ocean basins (e.g., Key & Constable, 2002). As a result, marine 532 MT data have limited resolution to the EC structure in the top 10 km or so (depending on the 533 thickness of conductive sediments). However, the high conductivity of seawater allows much 534 larger transmitter power outputs, typically at periods of 0.1-10 s, and makes marine CSEM 535 suitable for imaging EC structure in the crust and uppermost mantle where the marine MT

536 data lack sensitivity (e.g., Cox et al., 1986; Constable, 2013).

537 The skin depth provides a length scale that is critical to the MT method in another way. 538 Provided that the length scale *L* that the external source varies over satisfies  $L \gg \delta$ , the

impedance is independent of details of the source, which can then be assumed to be spatially

- 540 uniform. Indeed, this uniform source assumption is central to the MT method, allowing
- 541 measurements in a point (which of course could not constrain external source geometry) to
- 542 be used for EM sounding. Because source length scales are typically thousands of km this
- 543 assumption is generally well justified, although this may not be true close to the magnetic

poles (e.g., Peacock & Selway, 2016) or in the presence of geomagnetic pulsations (Murphy
& Egbert 2018). In the 1D case where resistivity varies only with depth, the impedance
tensor reduces to

547

$$\boldsymbol{Z} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & Z \\ -Z & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$
(27)

548 The scalar impedance is then just the ratio of orthogonal electric and magnetic field 549 components at the appropriate frequency *f*. For a uniform Earth of resistivity  $\rho$ , the 550 magnitude of the impedance takes the simple form  $|Z| = \sqrt{2\pi\mu_0\rho/T}$ . This justifies the 551 definition of an apparent resistivity ( $\rho_a$ ) for the MT method—i.e., for any impedance,  $\rho_a$  is 552 the resistivity of a uniform Earth that would explain the observed impedance amplitude

553 
$$\rho_a = \frac{T}{2\pi\mu_0} |Z|^2$$
 (28)

Since magnetic and electric fields are complex numbers in the frequency domain, the impedance also has a phase, with the electric field component (e.g.,  $E_x$ ) generally leading the corresponding orthogonal magnetic component ( $H_y$ ). In a uniform Earth (no variation of resistivity with depth), the phase lead is 45 degrees. When resistivity is decreasing with depth, phases are elevated; when resistivity is increasing with depth, phases drop below 45 degrees (see MT response figures in Section 4). Apparent resistivity and phase are related through the Hilbert transform for a 1D Earth.

561 If Earth resistivity is two dimensional (2D), with no variation along a preferred strike (for 562 example, along a fault separating distinct crustal blocks), the impedance tensor also takes a 563 simplified form

564

$$\boldsymbol{Z} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & Z_{xy} \\ Z_{yx} & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$
(29)

565 provided the coordinate system aligns with geologic strike, which we take to be in the direction of the *x*-axis. In this case, the MT response decouples into TE (transverse electric) 566 and TM (transverse magnetic) modes, corresponding to  $Z_{xy}$  and  $Z_{yx}$ , respectively. Electric 567 currents flow along the geologic strike for the TE mode, while for the TM mode current flows 568 569 across strike. In the general case where resistivity variations are three dimensional (3D), all 570 four components of the impedance will be nonzero. However, in almost all cases, the off-571 diagonal components of the impedance tensor dominate (as in the 1D and 2D cases) and so 572 the common practice is to focus more on these in MT interpretation.

573 Since the measured data vary with subsurface dimensionality, it is possible to analyze MT 574 data to determine the dimensionality of the Earth, calculate a geoelectric strike direction (if 575 present) and determine an appropriate inversion approach. There is an essentially complete

576 theory for 1D inversion of MT response curves (apparent resistivity and phase as a function

577 of frequency) at a single site for EC-depth profile (Whittall & Oldenberg, 1992). While this

578 1D approach is still used to get a quick estimate of subsurface EC profiles beneath each site 579 (e.g., Hamilton et al., 2006), in most modern applications impedance components from 580 multiple sites are inverted for 2D or 3D EC using standard regularized inversion methods, 581 i.e., a functional that penalizes data misfit and some measure of model roughness is 582 minimized. Because the forward problem (mapping EC to impedances) is nonlinear. 583 gradient-based schemes (e.g., Gauss-Newton, conjugate gradients, quasi-Newton) are 584 generally used. These still require the partial differential equations of EM induction (the 585 quasi-static Maxwell equations in a conductor) to be solved thousands of times, so 586 (especially in 3D) the inverse problem is computationally intensive. A survey of methods 587 used for MT inversion can be found in Rodi & Mackie (2012). Examples of widely used 2D 588 inversion codes include Occam2D (de Groot-Hedlin & Constable, 1990), and MARE2DEM 589 (Key, 2016), while some commonly used 3D inversion codes include WSINV3DMT 590 (Siripunvaraporn et al., 2005) and ModEM (Egbert & Kelbert, 2012; Kelbert et al., 2014).

591 As in all geophysical inverse problems, an infinite number of EC models can adequately fit 592 the field data. Different regularizations or parameterizations will produce different results, so any single inverse model is inherently subjective (Constable et al., 2015), and models 593 594 presented in the literature are thus often referred to as the "preferred model." Many 595 strategies attempt to address this intrinsic non-uniqueness and to understand what features 596 are resolved and required by the data. One widely used approach is to test robustness of a 597 particular feature in the preferred inverse solution (say a conductive anomaly of interest) by 598 altering its conductivity, forward calculating the MT responses, and comparing the model-599 to-data misfit against the original inversion. If the misfit is not increased significantly, the 600 feature is obviously not required by the data. An extension of this idea is "hypothesis testing," 601 where model features are added or removed, and the inversion is restarted with the 602 resistivity of the modified feature "frozen" to the specified value. Note that the sort of 603 checkerboard tests commonly used in seismic tomography are not often useful for MT data, 604 due to the significantly greater nonlinearity of the inverse problem (Burd et al. 2014). 605 Bayesian approaches to quantifying model uncertainty are also being pursued, but the 606 computational burden is significant enough that this is so far only tractable for 1D 607 applications (e.g., Blatter et al., 2019).

## 608 **4. EC predictions of lithosphere-asthenosphere system**

For the remainder of this review, we focus on the 1D forward problem. We generate a suite of depth-dependent EC predictions for different physical states and then forward model the MT responses. This allows us to probe questions such as (i) how distinct the EC predictions are for a variety of expected mantle states and what the potential sources of ambiguity are; and (ii) how sensitive the MT data are to changes in temperature, composition, and the other physical properties of interest. Even in our final example, a case study of the lithosphere beneath the southeastern United States, where fully 3D inversion was used to interpret an array of several hundred MT sites, considerable insight can be obtained from this 1Danalysis.

#### 618 **4.1 Oceanic Mantle**

619 The oceanic lithosphere-asthenosphere system is far simpler than its continental sibling.

- 620 Away from the influence of hotspots and plate boundaries, ocean basins have a relatively 621 uniform layered structure with small deviations from the global mean: a veneer of pelagic
- (2) and in our a (7) has this has a figure to a second at the sum of the second second
- 622 sediment, a 6–7 km thick mafic crust, and a peridotite upper mantle.
- 623 Our oceanic resistivity models consist of five compositionally distinct layers: atmosphere, 624 seawater, marine sediment, mafic crust, and peridotite upper mantle. The lower atmosphere 625 is an excellent insulator and typically exceeds  $10^{12} \Omega \cdot m$  (Singh et al., 2004). In contrast, the deep ocean is highly conductive with an average value of  $0.3 \pm 0.03 \Omega \cdot m$ , which has tight 626 627 bounds since seawater salinity varies by less than 10% from the global mean and the 628 temperature in waters deeper than 1 km is within a few degrees of 3°C. We treat the 629 sedimentary and crustal units as porous media containing a conductive fluid (seawater) in a 630 resistive matrix and apply Archie's law (Eq. 21). For convenience, we ignore clay content and 631 assign the Archie's exponent value m = 2. Due to the geothermal gradient, we calculate the 632 seawater EC as a function of mean layer temperature with the cubic relationship of Constable 633 et al. (2009). The sediment layer is 0.5 km thick and 0.8  $\Omega$ ·m (60% porosity, 5°C). The oceanic 634 crust consists of three sublayers with distinct porosities: extrusive basalts, sheeted dikes, 635 and gabbros. We adopt realistic porosities and thicknesses for the crustal layers based on a 636 global compilation of these properties by Jarrard (2003). The extrusive layer is 500 m thick 637 and 20  $\Omega$ ·m (10% porosity, 20°C). The dike layer is 1.5 km thick and 150  $\Omega$ ·m (3% porosity, 638 45°C). The gabbro layer is 4.5 km thick and 1250  $\Omega$ ·m (0.7% porosity, 120°C). These estimates are also consistent with marine CSEM observations of the oceanic crust (Key et al., 639 640 2012; Naif et al., 2015; Chesley et al., 2019). Since the characteristic porosity and thickness of oceanic crust does not deviate much from the global mean (e.g., White et al., 1992; Jarrard, 641
- 642 2003), we use the same crustal resistivity trend in all of our oceanic models.

### 643 **4.1.1 Anhydrous mantle**

644 Our first set of models aims to isolate the electrical effect of temperature by considering dry 645 upper mantle of fixed peridotitic composition. We adopt the compositional model of 646 Hirschmann et al. (2009), which contains 60 vol% olivine (this includes 2 vol% spinel that 647 we handle as olivine) and depth-dependent proportions of orthopyroxene, clinopyroxene, 648 and garnet (Fig 4a). Next, we calculate the depth-dependent temperature profiles with the 649 Hasterok (2013) plate cooling model for six plate ages (5, 10, 20, 40, 80, and 160 Ma) at two 650 mantle potential temperatures (MPTs) (1350°C and 1420°C). A 0.3°C/km adiabatic gradient

- 651 is added. The 12 geotherms are shown in Fig 4b. We use the temperatures to estimate the EC
- 652 for dry olivine (Constable, 2006), dry orthopyroxene (Zhang et al., 2012), dry clinopyroxene

(Zhao & Yoshino, 2016), and dry garnet (Dai & Karato, 2009a). Then, we apply the geometric
mean (Eq. 22) to get the bulk mantle EC shown in Fig 4c.

655 The forward-modelled MT responses and the relative differences between them are 656 presented in Fig 5 to showcase the data dependence on mantle temperature. Interestingly, 657 although the EC predictions differ for the two oldest ages, their respective MT responses are 658 identical. Even the 40 Ma responses do not differ appreciably from those of 80/160 Ma, 659 which suggests a lack of data sensitivity to highly resistive mantle. To test for the maximum 660 resistivity to which the MT data are sensitive, we take the EC prediction for the 160 Ma plate 661 (1350°C MPT) and impose an upper bound on the mantle resistivity, progressively lowering it until the forward modelled MT responses are impacted. The responses changed by up to 662 663 1.5% and 7.5% when the upper bound was reduced to 5000  $\Omega$ ·m and 1000  $\Omega$ ·m, respectively. 664 MT data errors vary from survey to survey but in practice are on the order of 2–10%. Therefore, given that 5000  $\Omega$ ·m dry peridotite mantle corresponds to about 1070°C, MT data 665 666 are insensitive to colder temperatures since they cannot distinguish higher resistivities. 667 Note, however, that the greater the thickness of a highly resistive lithosphere, the more 668 sensitive the MT data are to its true resistivity value. For example, when we consider a 150 669 km thick resistive lithosphere, twice the thickness as the previous test, the responses 670 changed by up to 3% and 13.5% when the upper bound was reduced to 5000  $\Omega$ ·m and 1000 671  $\Omega \cdot m$ , respectively.

672 The lack of sensitivity to highly resistive features is expected when we consider that the MT 673 method is better at constraining the conductance (the product of conductivity and thickness, 674 units of siemens [S]) than at resolving resistivity with depth. For example, in our oceanic 675 models the sediment layer, which is 0.5 km thick and 0.8  $\Omega$ ·m (1.25 S/m), has a conductance of 625 S, whereas the top 50 km of upper mantle is just 0.2 S for the 80 Ma plate and 0.1 S for 676 677 the 160 Ma plate. Therefore, the presence of the conductive sediment layer alone significantly hinders the ability of the data to resolve resistive features. This would then 678 679 imply that either reducing the thickness or increasing the resistivity of the sediment layer in 680 our models would significantly increase sensitivity to the highly resistive portion of the 681 lithosphere, which is indeed the case. For the 160 Ma plate model now with a sediment layer 682 resistivity of 4  $\Omega$ ·m (equivalent to 125 S), applying a 5000  $\Omega$ ·m upper bound on mantle 683 resistivity impacts the responses by almost 6%, compared to 1.5% in the original model with 684  $0.8 \Omega \cdot m$  sediment. In addition to the conductance, the skin depth approximation (Eq. 26) also 685 provides valuable insight. Specifically, even if we remove the sediment layer from the models 686 altogether, the MT data would still underestimate the resistivity of the cold shallow 687 lithosphere simply due to the deeper presence of a warm and therefore conductive 688 asthenosphere. Regardless, even if the MT data were able to resolve  $10^5 \Omega$ ·m mantle, this 689 would only correspond to about 850°C. We note that in contrast to the MT method, CSEM 690 data are highly sensitive to resistors and can resolve both the resistivity value and 691 anisotropy of the lithosphere (e.g., Chesley et al., 2019).



Figure 4: (a) Oceanic upper mantle peridotite composition. (b) Plate geotherms for 5, 10, 20, 40, 80,
and 160 Ma lithosphere from Hasterok (2013) plate cooling model. Solid lines use 1420°C MPT and
dashed lines use 1350°C MPT. (c) Predicted bulk mantle EC/resistivity for the composition in panel (a)
and all 12 geotherms in panel (b). Depth is in kilometers below seafloor.

692

697 All of the apparent resistivity (AR) curves in Fig 5 are remarkably similar at less than 100 s 698 period regardless of the MPT, with only small differences in phase that are equivalent to <5% 699 error (10% error in phase is  $\pm 2.85$  degrees). This is because the MT responses are mostly 700 sensing the same sediment, crust, and highly resistive structure in the uppermost mantle 701 that the data cannot distinguish. As the data sense the deeper more conductive mantle with 702 longer periods, the AR curves for the different plate ages diverge and become 703 distinguishable, with peak separation at around 500–1000 s. This also happens to be where 704 the phase curves in each set of MPT models crossover, indicating the data are sensitive to a 705 change in the resistivity gradient with depth. Phase curves can be thought of as reflecting the resistivity gradient, where phases <45° signify increasing resistivity with depth, phases >45° 706 707 signify decreasing resistivity with depth, and phases of 45° signify homogeneity (see Ch 2.5 708 in Simpson & Bahr, 2005). At periods longer than 1000 s, the AR curves within each set of 709 MPT models begin to converge as the data become increasingly sensitive to the 710 asthenosphere, where the EC is no longer dependent on plate age but only depth. At periods 711 of about 5000 s, the phase exceeds 45°, indicating sensitivity primarily to the conductive 712 asthenosphere and deeper mantle. Taken together, this set of models suggests that, in the

- 713 dry mantle case, the MT data provide constraints on temperatures in excess of ~1000°C,
- 714 keeping in mind that field data typically have errors of  $\sim 5\%$ .

#### 715 **4.1.2 Hydrous mantle**

- 716 Although NAMs are significantly more conductive under hydrous conditions, predicting the
- 717 bulk mantle conductivity depends strongly on a set of underlying assumptions that are either
- 718 debated or poorly constrained. The two leading uncertainties are choice of empirical EC law 719
- for a given mineral (see Fig 2) and choice of mixing model (see Fig 3). We will only consider
- 720 the former here.
- 721 Since garnet is less abundant than olivine and pyroxene and there are currently no
- 722 competing EC models for hydrous clinopyroxene, we follow the approach of Naif (2018) and 723 simplify the composition to just olivine and orthopyroxene. First, we adopt the suite of
- partition coefficients defined in Hirschmann et al. (2009) but replace the pyroxene 724 725 coefficients with updated values from O'Leary et al. (2010). We use these coefficients to 726 determine the water concentration in each mineral (olivine, garnet, orthopyroxene, 727 clinopyroxene) for 200 ppm water in the bulk mantle. We also account for the extraction of 728 water by partial melting during oceanic lithosphere formation at the ridge axis, which
- 729 renders the mantle dry at the shallower depths (<70 km) where dry melting occurs (e.g., 730 Hirth & Kohlstedt, 1996; Dasgupta et al., 2007). The resulting water distribution is presented 731 in Fig 6a.
- 732 Next, we simplify the composition by combining the garnet with olivine while also 733 preserving the bulk mantle water content

734 
$$C_{\rm o/g} = \frac{\phi_{\rm ol}C_{\rm ol} + \phi_{\rm gt}C_{\rm gt}}{\phi_{\rm ol} + \phi_{\rm gt}}$$
(30)

where  $\phi_{ol}$  and  $C_{ol}$  are the volume fraction and water content of olivine,  $\phi_{gt}$  and  $C_{gt}$  are the 735 volume fraction and water content of garnet, and  $C_{o/g}$  is the water content of the combined 736 737 olivine and garnet modes (dashed grey line in Fig 6a). We follow the same procedure for the 738 pyroxenes

739 
$$C_{\rm pyx} = \frac{\phi_{\rm opx}C_{\rm opx} + \phi_{\rm cpx}C_{\rm cpx}}{\phi_{\rm opx} + \phi_{\rm cpx}}$$
(31)

where  $C_{\text{pyx}}$  is the water content of the combined orthopyroxene and clinopyroxene modes 740 (solid grey line in Fig 6a). 741



742 743

Figure 5: MT responses as a function of period for dry oceanic mantle. (a) Apparent resistivity and (b)
phase. Line colors correspond to plate age geotherms from Fig 4b. Solid and dashed lines are 1420°C
MPT and 1350°C MPT, respectively. Relative differences between (c) apparent resistivity and (d) phase
responses. Solid and dashed line colors represent the differences between the 5 and 10 Ma (blue), 20
and 40 Ma (yellow), and 40 and 80 Ma (green) plate responses at the same MPT. Dash-dot line colors

represent the response differences between the two MPTs at 5 Ma (blue), 20 Ma (yellow), and 80 Ma

749 (green). Dark and light grey boxes are the 5% and 10% equivalent errors, respectively.

Lastly, we apply the HS<sup>+</sup> mixing model (Eq. 19) to calculate the bulk EC for the 10 Ma and 40 Ma geotherms (1350°C MPT; Fig 6b). Since the effect of water on the EC of NAMs is described by several competing models, we apply the endmember empirical relationships to give two contrasting EC trends for the same hydration level that represent an estimate of the uncertainty. The conductive endmember uses W06 for olivine and D09b for pyroxene (EC model naming convention corresponds to Fig 2 legend). The resistive endmember uses Y09

- for olivine and Z12 for pyroxene. Both are presented in Figure 6c. Although no comparison
  is shown, they are similar to the endmember models (solid red and blue curves) in Fig 3 that
- included garnet in their mixtures. We note that for the olivine water contents considered
- 759 here (<100 ppm), the Y09 and S19 olivine resistivity predictions are nearly identical (see Fig
- 760 **2a).** Figure 7 shows the corresponding MT responses.



Figure 6: (a) Water content distribution in oceanic mantle peridotite. Black line is the bulk mantle
 water content. Colored lines show water in each mineral phase. Grey dashed and solid lines are the

764 water in olivine and water in pyroxene calculated with Eq 30 and Eq 31, respectively. (b) Oceanic

765 plate geotherms for 1350°C MPT at 10 and 40 Ma. (c) Predicted bulk mantle EC based on temperature

766 and water content in panels (a) and (b).

761



767

Figure 7: MT responses as a function of period for hydrated oceanic mantle. (a) apparent resistivity and (b) phase. Solid and dashed lines correspond to 10 Ma and 40 Ma plate geotherms (1350°C MPT), respectively. Relative differences between (c) apparent resistivity and (d) phase responses. Line colors represent the response differences between 10 and 40 Ma for dry (black), resistive endmember (yellow), and conductive endmember (blue). The differences between dry, resistive endmember, and conductive endmember responses are not shown since they are significantly larger than typical data errors. Dark and light grey boxes are the 5% and 10% equivalent errors, respectively.

775 The endmember responses differ significantly from each other and their dry mantle 776 counterpart. This clearly demonstrates that MT data can easily differentiate between dry 777 resistive mantle and damp conductive mantle regardless of the discrepancy between 778 hydrous mineral EC models. Although the effect of 10 vs 40 Ma plate on the responses is 779 notably less than the contrast between dry and damp mantle or between damp endmember 780 models, it is still larger than typical data errors. In practice, temperature is also an important 781 source of uncertainty, but the magnitude of this uncertainty is not enough to misconstrue 782 dry and damp mantle (see Fig 3). However, this example also demonstrates remarkably 783 different responses between the hydrous mantle endmember models for what is ultimately 784 the same prescribed water content. The same is true in reverse, inferring water contents 785 from MT is highly dependent on endmember model choice and thus has large uncertainties. 786 The disagreement is significant enough that it can lead to contradictory interpretations on 787 whether parts of the asthenosphere are hydrated or contain partial melt (Wang et al., 2006; 788 Yoshino et al., 2006; Naif, 2018; Selway & O'Donnell, 2019), which is fundamental to 789 understanding the drivers of plate tectonics. This is precisely why it is so critical to resolve 790 the discrepancies between laboratory studies.

#### 791 **4.1.3 Partially molten mantle**

- 792 When the mantle undergoes melting, water has a strong affinity for and readily partitions
- into the melt phase. This process extracts nearly all of the water and essentially dries out the
- surrounding mantle rock. The melt is also several orders of magnitude more conductive than
- the solid matrix and can be interconnected even at very small melt fractions (e.g., Zhu et al.,
- 2011; Gardés et al., 2020). As a result, the bulk EC is dominated by the volume fraction,
- 797 interconnectivity, and volatile concentration of the melt.
- We consider four partial melt models for a 20 Ma plate. We apply the HS+ (Eq. 19) to calculate
- the bulk EC. For the solid mantle phase ( $\sigma_r$ ), we use the 20 Ma dry mantle EC from Fig 4c. For
- the melt phase ( $\sigma_c$ ), we calculate the EC with Eq. 16 for basaltic melt having 2 wt% H<sub>2</sub>O. The first and second models add 1 vol% hydrous partial melt to 60–120 km and 60–80 km
- depths, respectively. Since MT data are better at constraining the conductance than at
- resolving the EC with depth, the third and fourth models use the same conductance as the
- 60–120 km melt layer (~8.4 S) distributed over a 20 km thick (60–80 km depth) and 40 km
- 805 thick (60–100 km depth) layer. The MT responses are shown in Fig 8.
- 806 We intentionally consider partial melt models that have bulk EC predictions comparable to 807 the wet conductive endmember model over the depth interval where melt was added. As 808 expected, the partial melt and hydrous mantle MT responses look similar at periods less than 809 1000 s. However, differences in the phase are noticeable due to the sharp jump in EC at 60 km depth, where the transition from dry mantle to 1 vol% melt occurs. At longer periods, the 810 811 MT fields have increasing sensitivity to the dry resistive mantle below the melt channel, 812 hence the partial melt model responses steer back towards the dry mantle model response. 813 If we elected to assume the mantle below the melt channel was hydrated and assigned the 814 conductive endmember values, the partial melt and wet conductive endmember model 815 responses would more closely resemble one another. This example demonstrates why 816 interpreting MT data is nonunique. Multiple candidate mechanisms can be invoked to 817 enhance EC and explain the observations. In practice, distinguishing between partial melt, 818 hydration, and temperature interpretations is much more likely when independent 819 geological, petrological, geochemical, and geophysical constraints are available for synthesis. 820 In addition, a growing number of olivine EC measurements are significantly more resistive 821 than W06, which suggests that the conductive endmember model here is anomalous and the 822 resistive endmember is a better predictor of hydrated mantle EC. In that case, the capacity 823 to arrive at a unique solution is further improved since mantle water content alone would 824 not be able to explain high conductivity observations.



825

826 Figure 8: Comparison of MT responses for 20 Ma oceanic plate (1350°C MPT). (a) apparent resistivity and (**b**) phase. Thin solid lines show responses for dry (black) and 200 ppm  $H_2O$  mantle (resistive 827 828 endmember in yellow, conductive endmember in blue). Solid pink and solid red lines are the responses 829 for 1 vol% hydrous basaltic melt added to 60–80 km depth and 60–120 km depth, respectively. The 830 dashed and dotted red lines use the same conductance as the 60 km thick melt layer but distributed over 831 a 20 km thick (60–80 km depth) and 40 km thick layer (60–100 km depth), respectively. Relative 832 response differences in (c) apparent resistivity and (d) phase between the three models with equivalent 833 melt layer conductance. The differences between dry, damp endmembers, and melt model responses are 834 not shown since they are significantly larger than typical data errors. Dark and light grey boxes are the 835 5% and 10% equivalent errors, respectively.

### 836 4.2 Continental Mantle

837 In contrast to oceanic settings, the continental lithosphere is complex and highly 838 heterogeneous. We forward modelled the MT responses for predicted EC of continental 839 lithosphere of various compositions and geotherms. The topmost layer is 0.5 km thick and 840 50  $\Omega$ ·m. For the crust, we used a 'wet' composition, following the model of Selway (2018). This model consists of 10 vol% amphibole throughout the crust (conductivity from Wang et 841 842 al., 2012) and petrologically constrained modal proportions of orthopyroxene (conductivity 843 from Yang et al., 2012), clinopyroxene (conductivity from Yang et al., 2011), quartz 844 (conductivity from Wang et al., 2010) and feldspar (conductivity from Yang et al., 2012). This 845 crustal composition is highly resistive (>10<sup>4</sup>  $\Omega$ ·m) as it does not contain any conductive 846 phases such as pore fluids or graphite.



847

848Figure 9: Resistivity structure of simplified continental upper mantle. (a) Geotherms for 100 km and849200 km thick lithosphere. Predicted resistivity-depth profiles for (b) 100 km thick lithosphere and (c)850200 km thick lithosphere modelled with both dry and 200 wt ppm  $H_2O$  peridotite compositions and851modal mineralogies of Archon, Tecton, and Proton bulk compositions. The conductive endmember uses852the W06 olivine conductivity formulation and the D09b pyroxene formulation, while the resistive853endmember uses Y09 and Z12.

854 For the lithospheric mantle, we used the xenolith-derived Archon, Proton, and Tecton modal compositions of Griffin et al. (2009), where Archon lithosphere has been stable since >2.5 Ga 855 856 and is composed of 88 vol% olivine, 11 vol% orthopyroxene, and 1 vol% garnet; Proton 857 lithosphere experienced tectonism at 2.5-1 Ga and is composed of 68 vol% olivine, 20 vol% 858 orthopyroxene, 5 vol% clinopyroxene, and 7 vol% garnet; and Tecton lithosphere was 859 formed or modified after 1 Ga and is composed of 62 vol% olivine, 12 vol% orthopyroxene, 860 12 vol% clinopyroxene, and 14 vol% garnet. The conductivity calculations for these models 861 and the mixing models used to combine them were the same as for the oceanic mantle. For the asthenospheric mantle, we calculated modal proportions of olivine, pyroxene, and garnet 862 863 from the formulations of Hirschmann et al. (2009), as was done for the oceanic mantle 864 models.



865

866Figure 10: Forward modelled MT sounding curves for lithosphere with both dry and wet (200 wt ppm867 $H_2O$ ) peridotite compositions. (a) Apparent resistivity and (b) phase for 100 km thick lithosphere. (c)868Apparent resistivity and (d) phase for 200 km thick lithosphere. While the difference between dry and869wet responses is measurable, the differences in the sounding curves between Archon, Tecton, and

870 Proton compositions are smaller than the thickness of the lines and hence unresolvable in real data.

- Models were run for lithospheric thicknesses of 100 and 200 km with crustal thicknesses of 20 and 30 km, respectively. Steady-state lithospheric geotherms were calculated using standard models (Jaupart et al., 2007) with mantle heat production of 2 x 10<sup>-8</sup> mW/m<sup>3</sup>. The asthenospheric adiabat was set at 0.45 K/km (Katsura et al., 2010). All lithospheric mantle models were run at dry conditions and with a total peridotite water content of 200 wt ppm, while the asthenosphere water content was set to 200 wt ppm in all models. Hydrous models were run using both the conductive and resistive endmember empirical conductivity laws,
- and hydrogen partitioning between minerals was calculated via the partition coefficients of
- Hirschmann et al. (2009) and O'Leary et al. (2010), as was done for the oceanic mantle
- 880 models. Figure 9 shows the temperature and EC predictions for upper mantle with dry and
- 881 wet lithosphere, and Figure 10 shows the corresponding MT responses.
- All results show that the changes in modal proportions between Archon, Tecton, and Proton
- 883 mantle produce minor differences in the bulk EC and thus in the MT responses as well, at
- 884 least for the mixing model and water partitioning considered here (see Özaydin & Selway

885 (2020) for compositional effects on EC with different mixing models and water partitioning).

- 886 In contrast, the addition of water produces a measurable decrease in AR and in the gradient
- 887 of the phase curve. Since the resistive endmember predicts that water has a smaller effect on
- 888 olivine conductivity, these models show a concomitantly smaller decrease in apparent
- resistivity. All AR curves have a general decreasing trend, although the models with 200 km
- thick lithosphere show a peak in AR at a period of  $\sim$ 20 s whereas the AR for 100 km thick
- 891 lithosphere models peaks at a shorter period than shown here. Per the skin depth
- approximation (Eq. 26), this is because the 200 km thick lithosphere models remain highly
  resistive to greater depths and as a result the MT data begin to sense the deeper conductive
- 894 mantle at longer periods relative to the 100 km thick lithosphere models.
- 895 The models with a 200 km thick lithosphere have higher AR than those with 100 km thick
- lithosphere at all but the longest periods (greater than  $\sim 10^4$  s). The phase data show clear
- differences between the lithospheric thickness models. All phase curves show a peak of ~7080 degrees at a period of several hundred seconds. At shorter periods the resistivity
- increases with depth as the MT signals move from the lower crust to the uppermost mantle
- increases with depth as the MT signals move from the lower crust to the uppermost mantle.
   The peak occurs where the gradient in AR curves is strongest in the uppermost mantle before
- 901 flattening out in the deeper lithosphere and asthenosphere. As noted earlier, this peak is of
- 902 higher magnitude and occurs at longer periods in the 200 km thick lithosphere models due 903 to the greater depth extent of the highly resistive mantle. Apparent resistivities in the
- 903 to the greater depth extent of the highly resistive mantle. Apparent resistivities in the 904 resistive endmember models decrease more homogeneously in the lithospheric mantle, 905 leading to flatter phase curves. In the adiabatic geotherm of the asthenosphere, the AR curves
- 906 decrease more slowly, leading to lower phase values.
- 907 We also considered the impact of asthenospheric partial melt on continental MT sounding 908 curves. For simplicity, we only considered carbonated melt since carbon-free melt is unlikely 909 to be thermodynamically stable to an extensive depth range beneath continental lithosphere (Hirschmann, 2010). We added 1 vol% carbonated melt to our previously computed 910 911 peridotite compositions, which were fixed at 200 wt ppm water. Because the water in mantle 912 minerals will preferentially partition into the melt phase and the addition of water to the 913 melt enhances its EC, we used the partitioning relationships of Hirschmann et al. (2009) to 914 estimate the water content in the melt. Calculations were made for dry and 200 wt ppm 915 water with Proton lithosphere compositions for both 100 and 200 km lithospheric 916 thicknesses, using the experimental conductivity formulations of the resistive and 917 conductive endmembers, as was done for hydous melt-free mantle.
- All results show similar trends and show that the decrease in asthenospheric resistivity caused by the interconnected melt has a strong effect on the MT responses (Fig 11). The AR values for the melt-bearing models are the same as the melt-free models at periods less than a few hundred seconds, where the signals have not penetrated into the asthenosphere. At longer periods, the AR values for the melt-bearing models decrease more sharply than the melt-free models. The melt-bearing AR curves of the resistive and conductive endmember

- 924 models also converge at the longest periods since the bulk resistivity of the asthenosphere
- 925 is dominated by the melt resistivity even at a melt fraction of only 1 vol%. However, the AR
- 926 is lower for the models with 100 km thick lithosphere than those with 200 km lithosphere
- 927 since more of the signal is penetrating into the asthenosphere. Phase values for the melt-
- 928 bearing models are higher than the melt-free models at periods longer than a few hundred
- seconds since the imaged resistivity is decreasing more sharply with depth. The difference
- 930 between wet and dry lithosphere models is more pronounced for the conductive
- 931 endmember formulation due to the larger influence of water on conductivity.

## 932 **5. Discussion**

## 933 **5.1 Oceanic Mantle**

- Oceanic plates are continuously being regenerated and recycled at plate boundaries, and the
  very process that gives birth to oceanic lithosphere at mid-ocean ridges is fairly uniform as
  exemplified by narrow range of observed crustal thicknesses globally (White et al., 1992).
  Unsurprisingly, the oceanic lithosphere-asthenosphere system is considered to be "simple,"
  having a relatively well-defined composition and 1D layered structure where temperature
  (plate age) is the dominant variable that modulates the rheology. Yet there is still no
- 940 consensus on the origin of the low viscosities in the asthenosphere. While on average oceanic
- 941 lithosphere is indeed younger and less modified than continental lithosphere, a growing
- 942 number of observations either invoke mechanisms other than temperature to explain 943 geophysical observations and/or show a much more complex and dynamic system than
- originally thought (e.g., Beghein et al., 2014; Kawakatsu & Utada, 2017). This is certainly also
- 945 reflected in marine MT observations.
- 946 Figure 12 shows the MT responses and Figure 13 shows the dry mantle temperature vs. 947 water content vs. partial melt fraction required to explain the modelled EC observations 948 from 3 Ma (Evans et al., 2005), 23 Ma (Naif et al., 2013), 70 Ma (Sarafian et al., 2015), and 949 130 Ma (Baba et al., 2013) oceanic plates. We calculate the dry mantle temperatures following the methodology in Section 4.1.1. These temperature estimates often exceed the 950 951 plate cooling model geotherms. Alternatively, we adopt the expected temperatures from the 952 plate cooling model geotherms and use them to calculate either the water content or the 953 partial melt fraction that matches the observations. For the hydration estimates, we follow 954 Section 4.1.2 and consider both the resistive and conductive endmember EC laws as well as 955 both the 1350°C and 1420°C MPT geotherms. As expected, the results exhibit a large 956 discrepancy between the endmembers. For the partial melt estimates, we follow Section 957 4.1.3 and fix the water content in the melt at 2 wt% H<sub>2</sub>O. In practice, this water content 958 depends on the hydration state of the mantle where the melt was formed as well as the 959 degree of melting.





967

961 *Figure 11*: Forward modelled MT sounding curves for melt-bearing asthenosphere with dry and damp

962 lithosphere. (a) Apparent resistivity and (b) phase for 100 km thick lithosphere. (c) Apparent

963 resistivity and (**d**) phase for 200 km thick lithosphere. Red lines show 1 vol% asthenospheric melt

964 responses for dry (dashed lines) and 200 wt ppm  $H_2O$  mantle (solid lines), respectively. Yellow and blue

965 lines are the melt-free resistive and conductive endmember models from Fig 10. Melt-bearing models

966 with damp mantle were run with the conductive endmember formulation.



Figure 12: Comparison between MT responses from predictions and select seafloor observations. Field
examples are from approximately 1D oceanic plate at different ages: 23 Ma Cocos plate (Naif et al.,
2013), 70 Ma Pacific plate (Sarafian et al., 2015), and 130 Ma Pacific plate (Baba et al., 2013). Predicted
model responses are taken from Fig 7.



973 *Figure 13:* The first column panels show the resistivity observations. The second column panels show 974 the dry mantle temperature required to explain the observations (red lines) and compares them against 975 the expected temperature from plate cooling models for both 1350°C (green dashed lines) and 1420°C 976 MPT (blue dashed lines). The third column panels show the water contents that explain the observations 977 estimated with the resistive endmember formulation (blue lines) and conductive endmember 978 formulation (green lines) for both the 1350°C MPT (dashed lines) and 1420°C MPT geotherm (solid 979 lines). The fourth column panels show the melt fraction required to explain the observations for the 980 1350°C MPT (dashed lines) and 1420°C MPT geotherm (solid lines).

981 The results for the 23 Ma plate provide an example where a unique interpretation exists. 982 This is because the dry solid-state mantle temperature estimates are so high that they exceed 983 the dry solidus and would induce melting. Similarly, the water content estimates are so high 984 that they exceed the hydrated solidus and would also induce melting (Naif et al., 2013; Naif, 985 2018). Therefore, partial melt is required. The remaining observations are nonunique and 986 need additional independent constraints. For example, the results for the 3 Ma plate are 987 nonunique in the 1350°C MPT geotherm case; the dry mantle temperature and the 1420°C 988 MPT water content estimates exceed the dry and hydrated solidus, respectively, thereby 989 requiring melt. However, both the MT and collocated seismic observations there suggest that 990 melting beneath the ridge axis—where the plate is 0 Ma—extends to at least 100 km depths 991 (Forsyth et al., 1998; Baba et al., 2006). In order for melt production to extend that deep, the 992 MPT must be larger than 1350°C or the mantle must be highly hydrated, both of which point 993 to a partial melt interpretation (Naif, 2018). The observations for the 70 and 130 Ma plates 994 are fully nonunique and can be attributed to either slightly elevated temperatures (dry 995 mantle case), nearly dry mantle (conductive endmember case), a reasonable water content 996 that is consistent with MORB estimates (resistive endmember case), or a very small melt 997 fraction (<<1%) (Sarafian et al., 2015; Naif, 2018).

### 998 **5.2 Continental mantle**

- 999 One of the most striking discoveries about the continental lithospheric mantle over the past
- 1000 few decades has been its electrical complexity. From early lithosphere-scale surveys such as
- 1001 Lithoprobe in Canada (e.g., Jones et al., 2005) to recent continent-scale arrays such as
- 1002 USArray, SinoProbe, and AusLAMP (e.g., Dong et al., 2013; Meqbel et al., 2014; Robertson et
- 1003 al., 2016; 2020), MT models show that conductivity contrasts of orders of magnitude exist
- 1004 within continental lithospheric mantle that might have otherwise been thought to be 1005 homogenous.



1006

1007 Figure 14: Comparison between predicted and observed MT sounding curves. (a) Apparent resistivity 1008 and (b) phase for examples from approximately 1D cratonic regions in the Tanzanian craton (Selway, 1009 2015), southern Africa (SAMTEX dataset, Jones et al., 2009), and the Superior craton (USArray dataset, 1010 Yang et al., 2015), which show broadly similar patterns to the forward modelled theoretical curves 1011 (yellow/blue lines). (c) Apparent resistivity and (d) phase for examples for alternate examples from 1012 approximately 1D, cratonic regions in southern Africa (SAMTEX dataset, Jones et al., 2009) and East Antarctica (Station B22, Wannamaker et al., 2017), which show strongly contrasting patterns to the 1013 1014 forward modelled theoretical curves.

1015 A comparison between the MT forward models produced for expected standard 1016 compositions and real MT data from various parts of the world highlights this observation. 1017 In some regions, MT sounding curves approximately match the forward models, with 1018 generally decreasing values of apparent resistivity with period and phase curves with a peak 1019 between 100 and 1000 s period (Fig 14a-b). Differences between these results and the forward modelled curves produced from standard lithospheric models could be attributed 1020 1021 to slight changes in geotherm or hydration. However, most sounding curves from the real 1022 Earth show very little similarity to those calculated in the forward models (Fig 14c-d) and 1023 suggest substantial deviations from the standard lithospheric models. All sounding curves 1024 chosen for this comparison were from cratonic regions, where geochemical and seismic data 1025 (Griffin et al., 2009) would suggest the continental lithospheric mantle is at its most 1026 homogenous. Additionally, their MT responses suggest an approximately 1D, or horizontally

layered, Earth resistivity model. Even in these settings, the MT data show that the continentallithospheric mantle is much more complex than suggested by simple predictions.

1029 The differences between the forward modelled and observed continental MT data have 1030 several plausible explanations. Some of these relate to crustal complexities not included in our forward models. Near-surface features can cause galvanic distortion of the EM fields 1031 1032 being measured by the MT method, including a frequency-independent 'static shift' that 1033 causes the apparent resistivity values to be offset up or down the vertical axis (e.g., Jones, 1034 2012). This could explain, for instance, the relatively low magnitude of the apparent 1035 resistivity values in the Tanzanian craton compared to the forward models (Fig 14a-b), but it is not able to explain differences between the observed and modelled phases or the 1036 1037 contrasting shapes of the apparent resistivity curves shown in Fig 14c-d. The crustal 1038 composition used in our forward model was simple and of high resistivity, containing some 1039 amphibole but otherwise composed of anhydrous minerals, and not containing any strongly 1040 conductive phases like graphite or pore fluids. In contrast, many crustal regions worldwide 1041 have anomalously low resistivities (e.g., Jones & Ferguson, 2001). This has an effect on mantle MT models since the depth penetration of an MT signal is dependent on both the 1042 1043 period of the signal and the resistivity of the Earth. Therefore, if the crust is more conductive 1044 in the regions shown in Fig 14 than in our forward model, the MT signals at a given period 1045 will be imaging a shallower depth than in our forward model response.

1046 The most important reason that the observed continental MT data differ from the forward 1047 models is that, even in stable continental lithosphere, the Earth is more complex than the 1048 models. Significant conductors and lateral heterogeneity have been found in every craton 1049 that has been imaged with MT (e.g., Jones et al., 2003; Thiel et al., 2005; Padilha et al., 2006; 1050 Jones et al., 2009; Yang et al., 2015). In some regions, the magnitude of these conductors is 1051 such that they could reasonably be caused by high water contents in standard, nominally 1052 anhydrous mantle minerals (e.g., the Tanzanian craton; Selway, 2015). However, in other 1053 regions, these conductors are of such a large magnitude that they cannot be explained by 1054 petrologically plausible water contents and must indicate the presence of graphite or other 1055 highly conductive phases (e.g., Jones et al., 2003; Bedrosian, 2016; Wunderman et al., 2018), 1056 or possibly rock deformation (e.g., Pommier et al., 2018).

1057 Most continental evolution models predict neither high water contents nor significant 1058 volumes of highly conductive minerals in the lithospheric mantle. However, these models 1059 were mostly developed before extensive MT images of the continental lithosphere were 1060 available. Seismic tomography models, which have been instrumental in developing our 1061 understanding of the mantle, are not sensitive to water content (e.g., Cline et al., 2018), so 1062 hydrogen-related conductors would not be expected to have a tomographic response. 1063 Continental evolution models propose that the lithosphere should become more dehydrated 1064 as it ages and is subject to melting and depletion events (Griffin et al., 2009). However, 1065 geochemical studies of mantle xenoliths have found that many have unexpectedly high water

1066 contents and that even cratonic mantle is geochemically heterogeneous (e.g., Demouchy & 1067 Bolfan-Casanova, 2016), with many regions experiencing extensive metasomatism that 1068 could feasibly lead to increased water contents and/or the deposition of conductive 1069 minerals. Seismic S-wave receiver functions are sensitive to complexities in the lithospheric 1070 mantle including the presence of hydrous minerals, which could cause some conductive 1071 anomalies. Like MT, these receiver functions have shown that the continental lithosphere is 1072 significantly more complex than previously believed (e.g., Selway et al., 2015). Together, 1073 these geochemical and geophysical datasets show that traditional models of continental 1074 evolution are too simplistic. Updated continental evolution models should take advantage of 1075 the insights offered by MT, especially since many of the features imaged in MT models are 1076 invisible to other methods.

## 1077 **5.3 Case Study: MT Constraints on Thermal Lithospheric Thickness in the**

## 1078 Southeastern United States

1079 Here we consider a specific example of the value of MT mantle imaging in a continental 1080 setting. Given the multiple factors that control EC in the mantle as well as the intrinsic 1081 uncertainties in laboratory-derived EC laws (see Section 2.3), it is often difficult to obtain 1082 useful upper mantle temperature estimates from MT data alone. However, in certain 1083 situations, MT imaging can provide a very strong constraint on temperature, and the 1084 resulting bounds may be more robust than those derived from seismic methods. Generally, 1085 such situations arise when imaged resistivity values fall within the high-resistivity upper 1086 limit of observable values.

1087 As shown in Figure 3, dry mantle mineral conduction laws form an upper bound on how 1088 resistive the upper mantle can be as a function of temperature. Consequently, an observed 1089 resistivity value provides an upper limit on mantle temperature; any amount of hydration 1090 would only lower the temperature inferred from the observed conductivity value. 1091 Additionally, while the dry EC laws for all volumetrically significant upper mantle minerals 1092 may differ slightly, the magnitude of the difference is too small, at least in the case of dry 1093 subcontinental mantle, for the MT data to be able to discern between those laws (see Section 1094 4.2). Therefore, this upper bound on temperature can be established regardless of the details 1095 of mineralogy and composition, although its usefulness is limited to regions of the mantle 1096 hotter than ~1000°C since MT data lack sensitivity to highly resistive structures (see Section 1097 4.1.1).

1098 Globally, MT imaging of the mantle lithosphere has shown that bulk resistivity values are 1099 often low enough ( $\sim 100 \ \Omega \cdot m$ ) to require at least some degree of hydration (see Section 5.2). 1100 This is because the upper bound temperature derived from such moderate resistivity values 1101 are unrealistic and much higher than the temperature bounds placed by other geophysical 1102 techniques. Although inferring temperature information from MT imaging has proven to be 1103 seldom useful, we can leverage independent constraints on temperature to then provide an 1104 estimate on mantle hydration, which is a highly valuable constraint when considering that seismic methods may be insensitive to water content (e.g., Cline et al., 2018). However, although rare, in some locations the observed upper mantle resistivity values are high enough (>300  $\Omega$ ·m) to provide valuable constraints on temperature. The southeastern United States (SEUS) is one such region, which has a Tecton-type mantle.

1109 In the SEUS, long-period MT data reveal well-resolved high resistivity values (>300  $\Omega$ ·m)

- 1110 that extend to great depths beneath the Piedmont and Coastal Plain physiographic provinces
- 1111 (Fig 15; Murphy & Egbert, 2017; Murphy & Egbert, 2019). This unusual, high-resistivity
- 1112 structure has been nicknamed the *Piedmont Resistor* (Murphy & Egbert, 2017). As shown by
- Figure 3, the high resistivity values here require temperatures <1300°C to at least 200 km depth. As the thermal lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary beneath continents is often
- 1115 taken to be the 1330°C isotherm, the MT results therefore indicate that the thermal
- 1116 lithosphere beneath this portion of the SEUS must be at least 200 km thick (Murphy & Egbert,
- 1117 **2017**).

1118 This conclusion appears to be in contradiction with inferences from seismic imaging studies;

1119 recovered velocities at ~150-200 km depth that are slightly slow with respect to reference 1120 models have motivated an interpretation of <150 km-thick thermal lithosphere in this region</p>

1121 (e.g., Schmandt & Lin, 2014; Pollitz & Mooney, 2016; Wagner et al., 2018; Fig. 15). However,

- 1122 in calculating seismic velocity as a function of temperature and depth in this region using
- 1123 different models of anelastic controls on seismic observables, it becomes apparent that the
- 1124 recovered absolute seismic velocities are in fact consistent with the predicted velocities at
- 1125 the cold (<1300°C) temperatures required by the MT data (Fig. 15; Murphy & Egbert, 2019).
- 1126 Therefore, taken together, both the MT and seismic results (surface- and body-wave imaging,
- 1127 attenuation maps, converted wave imaging) support uniformly thick (~200 km) thermal
- 1128 lithosphere beneath the SEUS (Murphy & Egbert, 2019).
- 1129 It is worth noting that the MT data here effectively constrain the depth to the base of the
- 1130 resistive lithosphere yet poorly constrain the resistivity distribution within the Piedmont
- 1131 Resistor. As discussed in Section 4.1.1, MT imaging often lacks sensitivity to the absolute
- 1132 resistivity value of highly resistive structures (>10<sup>4</sup>  $\Omega$ ·m), so that the inverted values can be
- 1133 substantially increased with essentially no effect on data fit. As the data cannot constrain
- 1134 exactly how high the resistivity values are within this structure, the lower bound on
- 1135 temperature there is also unconstrained. Therefore, the MT data require the 1300°C
- 1136 isotherm to be at least at 200 km depth, but a range of lithospheric geotherms within the
- 1137 Piedmont Resistor would satisfy the data (see Murphy & Egbert, 2019).
- 1138 The Piedmont Resistor is highly unusual. The constituent lithosphere is more resistive than
- 1139 that observed in some cratonic regions (cf. Sections 4.2 and 5.2), and it is far more resistive
- 1140 than what might be expected for lithosphere that experienced rifting in association with
- 1141 breakup of Pangaea and opening of the Atlantic Ocean in the early Mesozoic (e.g., Attias et
- al., 2017). Previous geodynamic interpretations for the SEUS based on seismic images alone

- 1143 have suggested that the lithosphere here was thinned during rifting and that the mantle
- 1144 lithosphere has been subsequently eroded by piecemeal delamination and mantle edge
- 1145 convection over the last ~200 Myr (e.g., Biryol et al., 2016); however, the joint analysis of
- 1146 multiple geophysical datasets described above indicates that the lithosphere in the SEUS is
- 1147 uniformly thick (~200 km) and coherent. Therefore, the lithosphere here appears to have
- 1148 remained largely intact since the opening of the Atlantic Ocean (Murphy & Egbert, 2019).
- 1149 The modern lithospheric state is likely a direct result of eruption of the Central Atlantic Magmatic Province (CAMP) large igneous province, which is one of the largest recognized in 1150 1151 the geologic record (e.g., McHone, 2000). Major, widespread mantle melting associated with formation of the CAMP could have depleted the SEUS mantle to form a thick, coherent block 1152 1153 of subcontinental lithospheric mantle that persists today. Figure 15 shows possible mantle 1154 temperature and viscosity profiles over time for this region. The initial temperature profile, 1155 which reflects mantle potential temperature estimates based on the geochemistry of CAMP 1156 basalts (Hole, 2015; Shellnutt et al., 2018), only crosses an approximate "wet" (bulk 100 wt 1157 ppm H<sub>2</sub>O) solidus at depths less than  $\sim$ 130 km, much shallower than the full depth extent of the Piedmont Resistor. However, a higher bulk water content, as might be expected for 1158 1159 pervasively subduction-modified mantle (e.g., Whalen et al., 2015), with water hosted in 1160 hydrous phases, could further depress the solidus and permit melt depletion to begin at the 1161 greater depths suggested by MT. Alternatively, delamination (e.g., Whalen et al., 2015) may have played some role in facilitating deeper melting. Although trace element geochemistry 1162 1163 of CAMP basalts suggests melting dominantly occurred at depths of ~60-70 km (Shellnutt et al., 2018), further study is warranted to critically test for a deep-melting signature in the 1164
- 1165 least evolved CAMP samples. These temperature calculations show that conductive cooling 1166 over ~200 Myr would allow the upper mantle to reach a thermal state roughly consistent
- 1167 with what is inferred from these geophysical results.
- 1168 Melt depletion would render the SEUS lithosphere compositionally buoyant and would also 1169 leave the constituent mantle virtually dry. The possible viscosity profiles in Figure 15
  - 1170 demonstrate that removal of water leads to a substantial increase in strength, and this
  - 1171 strength could permit the CAMP-depleted mantle to withstand convective destruction at its
- 1172 initial formation and to survive as a rigid block through time. Interestingly, the likely
- 1173 buoyancy and rigidity of this lithosphere has motivated speculation that the Piedmont
- 1174 Resistor may represent a Mesozoic example of craton formation (Murphy & Egbert, 2019),
- 1175 as compositional buoyancy and rheological strength are generally considered to be
- 1176 necessary conditions for long-term lithosphere stability.
- 1177 These MT-derived insights into lithospheric properties in the SEUS demonstrate the value of
- 1178 EC imaging for studies of the upper mantle, especially in combination with other geophysical
- 1179 techniques. In the SEUS, MT imaging is key to illuminating lithospheric properties and an
- 1180 associated geodynamic story that would remain opaque with seismic imaging alone.



1182 Figure 15: Southeastern United States (SEUS) case study. (a) Overview map with geographic locations 1183 and the cross-section profile (white line). (b) Resistivity cross section from MT imaging (from Murphy & 1184 *Eabert, 2019*); white line is the inferred thermal lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary ( $1330^{\circ}C$ ) 1185 isotherm). (c) Shear-wave velocity cross section from surface wave imaging, expressed as percent 1186 difference with respect to 4.5 km/s (from Wagner et al., 2018); black line is the 1330°C isotherm. 1187 Horizontal axis tick interval on the cross sections is 100 km. (d-e) Comparison of geophysical 1188 observations to anelastic predictions (after Murphy & Egbert, 2019). The black dashed line is the purely 1189 anharmonic prediction of velocity as a function of temperature (at the specified depth); the green 1190 shaded region is the range of anelastic predictions from the model of Jackson & Faul (2010) for grain 1191 sizes of 10 cm (dark shading) to 1 mm (light shading); and the solid blue line is the anelastic prediction 1192 from the model of Karato et al. (2015) for a grain size of 5 mm. The red dot shows the median resistivity-1193 shear velocity (Vs) pair for observations within the Piedmont Resistor volume at the specified depth 1194 (from the two displayed geophysical images); the bars show the full range of Vs values. The one-to-one 1195 mapping between resistivity and temperature assumes a dry olivine conduction law (justified by the 1196 very high resistivity values within the Piedmont Resistor). The exact matchup between observations and 1197 predictions is unimportant, as there are many factors (e.g., the details of mantle mineralogy, the effect 1198 of mineral chemistry on Vs) that are ignored here; rather, these plots demonstrate that the anelastic 1199 predictions can explain relatively slow shear velocities at the cold temperatures required by the MT 1200 data. ( $\mathbf{f}$ - $\mathbf{g}$ ) Possible temporal evolution of temperature and effective viscosity within the Piedmont 1201 Resistor. The temperature calculation assumes purely one-dimensional conduction starting from a 1202 mantle potential temperature of 1450°C (Hole, 2015; Shellnutt et al., 2018). Also plotted are a dry 1203 peridotite solidus (solid black line; Hirschmann, 2000) and a "wet" peridotite solidus, calculated with 1204 the cryoscopic approximation (Hirschmann et al., 2009) for bulk 1000 wt ppm  $H_2O$  (dashed black line). 1205 The effective viscosity calculations use the OL-WB1/g model of Jain et al. (2019) with dry mantle (1 wt 1206 ppm  $H_2O$ ) within the Piedmont Resistor and "damp" mantle (200 wt ppm  $H_2O$ ) beneath the Piedmont 1207 Resistor.

1181

### 1208 **6. Conclusions**

1209 The electrical conductivity signature of the mantle depends on a confluence of factors, 1210 including temperature, composition, the concentration of structurally bound hydrogen (i.e., water content) in nominally anhydrous minerals, the partial melt fraction, and the 1211 1212 concentration of volatiles  $(H_2O+CO_2)$  dissolved in the melt. We have explored some of the 1213 tradeoffs between these factors. We have also explored some of the uncertainties that stem 1214 from applying competing empirical EC laws for hydrated mantle minerals and from applying different geometric mixing models. Clearly, these all have the capacity to significantly 1215 1216 influence the bulk mantle EC, and a fundamental non-uniqueness therefore exists that 1217 further complicates interpretations. These complexities must be taken into account when 1218 inferring physical properties from EC observations. Incorporating complementary 1219 techniques and independent constraints is necessary to reduce the uncertainty as well as the 1220 non-uniqueness. Applying a realistic multi-phase mantle composition and petrology 1221 constraints such as the distribution of water is warranted. For example, since the water 1222 solubility and the damp solidus for the mantle both provide an upper limit on bulk hydration, 1223 in some cases a hydration inference can be ruled out when the amount of water required to 1224 explain a bulk mantle EC value exceeds this limit. To that end, resolving the discrepancy 1225 between laboratory studies on the EC of hydrated minerals will be critical for accurately 1226 quantifying the volatile inventory of the mantle and its regional variability. Although we did 1227 not directly consider the effect of petrology uncertainties in, for example, water partitioning 1228 values between mantle minerals on the EC predictions, it is important to note that these 1229 uncertainties are also relevant. Whether pyroxenes hold 5 or 20 times as much water as 1230 olivine will translate to large differences in the bulk mantle water content inferred from EC 1231 observations.

1232 MT data must be inverted for EC structure, which has its own set of uncertainties that are 1233 also critical to consider. Deterministic inversions provide a qualitative assessment of the 1234 uncertainty in the modelled EC structure. Ultimately, Bayesian inversion is necessary to 1235 account for data errors and to quantitatively assign confidence levels to interpretations, 1236 although this is currently computationally prohibitive in 2D and 3D. The electrical mantle is 1237 certainly not everywhere an isotropic 1D layered structure but is regionally heterogeneous 1238 and potentially anisotropic. Although geophysical inversion and anisotropy were beyond the 1239 scope of our review, we did explore in 1D the sensitivity of MT responses to different mantle 1240 physical states. We have shown that MT data are highly sensitive to conductors and therefore 1241 (non-uniqueness aside) can effectively constrain the lithosphere thickness, mantle potential 1242 temperature, bulk hydration, melt porosity, and other factors that enhance conductivity. MT 1243 data are also insensitive to resistors (>10<sup>4</sup>  $\Omega \cdot m$ ) when said resistors are bounded by 1244 relatively conductive features above and/or below, as is always the case on Earth due to the 1245 presence of the asthenosphere and deeper conductive mantle. It is therefore important to

bear in mind that MT inversions may not automatically yield high resistivity values in thelithosphere, whereas CSEM data are sensitive to resistors and complementary in this regard.

1248 Despite these complexities and limitations, we emphasize that EC is currently the *only* 1249 geophysically observable quantity that can readily be used as a proxy for mantle hydration, 1250 melt volatile content and aqueous fluid salinity. It is also the leading tool for imaging 1251 migration pathways and mapping porosity of aqueous fluids and partial melts, among other 1252 things. Furthermore, MT does not operate in a vacuum; when integrated with petrology, 1253 seismology, and other geochemical and geophysical data, EC observations have 1254 demonstrably shown their capacity to yield unique constraints on the structure and 1255 composition of the mantle.

1256

1257

## 1258 Acknowledgements

1259 This work was initiated at a Cooperative Institute for Dynamic Earth Research (CIDER)

- 1260 supported workshop held in Fort Collins (EAR-1135452), May 2017. AP acknowledges
- 1261 support from NSF-CAREER grant 1750746. BSM is supported by a Mendenhall Postdoctoral
- 1262 Fellowship through the U.S. Geological Survey. We thank Phil Wannamaker and an
- 1263 anonymous reviewer for their constructive comments. We also thank Anna Kelbert, Krissy
- 1264 Lewis, Brian Shiro, and Janet Slate for their review of this contribution. SN thanks Kerry
- 1265 Key and the LDEO EM Geophysics Lab for discussions.

## 1266 **References**

1267 Aizawa, K., Koyama, T., Hase, H., Uyeshima, M., Kanda, W., Utsugi, M., et al. (2014). Three-

- 1268 dimensional resistivity structure and magma plumbing system of the Kirishima Volcanoes
- 1269 as inferred from broadband magnetotelluric data. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid* 1270 *Earth*, 119(1), 198–215.
- 1271 Archie, G. E. (1942). The electrical resistivity log as an aid in determining some reservoir 1272 characteristics. *Transactions of the AIME*, *146*(01), 54–62.
- 1273 Arrhenius, S. (1889). On the reaction rate of the inversion of non-refined sugar upon 1274 souring. *Z. Phys. Chem.* 4, 226–248.
- 1275 Attias, E., Evans, R. L., Naif, S., Elsenbeck, J., & Key, K. (2017). Conductivity structure of the
- 1276 lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary beneath the eastern North American margin.
- 1277 *Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems*, 18(2), 676–696.
- 1278 Baba, K., Chave, A. D., Evans, R. L., Hirth, G., & Mackie, R. L. (2006). Mantle dynamics beneath
- 1279 the East Pacific Rise at 17 S: Insights from the Mantle Electromagnetic and Tomography
- 1280 (MELT) experiment. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 111(B2).

- 1281 Baba, K., Tada, N., Zhang, L., Liang, P., Shimizu, H., & Utada, H. (2013). Is the electrical
- 1282 conductivity of the northwestern Pacific upper mantle normal?. *Geochemistry, Geophysics,*
- 1283 *Geosystems*, 14(12), 4969–4979.
- 1284 Becker, K. (1985). Large-scale electrical resistivity and bulk porosity of the oceanic crust,
- 1285 Deep Sea Drilling Project Hole 504B, Costa Rica Rift. In *Initial reports DSDP, Leg 83, Balboa*
- 1286 to Balboa, Panama (pp. 419–427). US Govt. Printing Office; UK distributors, IPOD
- 1287 Committee, NERC, Swindon.
- 1288 Bedrosian, P.A (2016). Making it and breaking it in the Midwest: Continental assembly and
- rifting from modeling of EarthScope magnetotelluric data. *Precambrian Research*, 278, 337–
   361.
- 1291 Bedrosian, P. A., Peacock, J. R., Bowles-Martinez, E., Schultz, A., & Hill, G. J. (2018). Crustal
- 1292 inheritance and a top-down control on arc magmatism at Mount St Helens. *Nature*
- 1293 *Geoscience*, *11*(11), 865–870.
- 1294 Beghein, C., Yuan, K., Schmerr, N., & Xing, Z. (2014). Changes in seismic anisotropy shed
- light on the nature of the Gutenberg discontinuity. *Science*, *343*(6176), 1237-1240.
- Bell, D. R., Ihinger, P. D., & Rossman, G. R. (1995). Quantitative analysis of trace OH in garnet
  and pyroxenes. *American Mineralogist*, *80*(5–6), 465–474.
- 1298 Bell, D. R., Rossman, G. R., Maldener, J., Endisch, D., & Rauch, F. (2003). Hydroxide in olivine:
- 1299 A quantitative determination of the absolute amount and calibration of the IR
- 1300 spectrum. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 108(B2).
- 1301 Biryol, C. B., Wagner, L. S., Fischer, K. M., & Hawman, R. B. (2016). Relationship between
- 1302 observed upper mantle structures and recent tectonic activity across the Southeastern
- 1303 United States. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 121, 3393–3414.
- 1304 Blatter, D., Key, K., Ray, A., Gustafson, C., & Evans, R. (2019). Bayesian joint inversion of 1305 controlled source electromagnetic and magnetotelluric data to image freshwater aquifer
- 1306 offshore New Jersey. *Geophysical Journal International*, 218(3), 1822–1837.
- Boullier, A M, & Nicolas, A (1975). Classification of textures and fabrics of peridotite xenoliths
  from South African kimberlites, *Physics and Chemistry of the Earth*, 9, 467–475.
- 1309 Brace, W. F., & Orange, A. S. (1968). Electrical resistivity changes in saturated rocks during
- 1310 fracture and frictional sliding. *Journal of geophysical research*, 73(4), 1433–1445.
- 1311 Burd, A. I., Booker, J. R., Mackie, R., Favetto, A., & Pomposiello, M. C. (2014). Three-
- 1312 dimensional electrical conductivity in the mantle beneath the Payún Matrú Volcanic Field in
- 1313 the Andean backarc of Argentina near 36.5 S: Evidence for decapitation of a mantle plume
- 1314 by resurgent upper mantle shear during slab steepening. *Geophysical Journal*
- 1315 International, 198(2), 812–827.

- 1316 Caricchi, L., Gaillard, F., Mecklenburgh, J., & Le Trong, E. (2011). Experimental determination
- 1317 of electrical conductivity during deformation of melt-bearing olivine aggregates:
- 1318 Implications for electrical anisotropy in the oceanic low velocity zone. *Earth and Planetary*
- 1319 Science Letters, 302(1-2), 81–94.
- 1320 Chave, A. D., & Jones, A. G. (Eds.). (2012). *The magnetotelluric method: Theory and practice*.
- 1321 Cambridge University Press.
- 1322 Chave, A. D. (2012). Estimation of the magnetotelluric response function. *The*1323 *Magnetotelluric Method: Theory and Practice*, 165–218.
- 1324 Chesley, C., Key, K., Constable, S., Behrens, J., & MacGregor, L. (2019). Crustal cracks and
- 1325 frozen flow in oceanic lithosphere inferred from electrical anisotropy. *Geochemistry*,
- 1326 *Geophysics, Geosystems, 20*(12), 5979–5999.
- 1327 Cline II, C.J., Faul, U.H., David, E.C., Berry, A.J. and Jackson, I. (2018). Redox-influenced
- 1328 seismic properties of upper-mantle olivine. *Nature*, 555(7696).
- 1329 Comeau, M. J., Käufl, J. S., Becken, M., Kuvshinov, A., Grayver, A. V., Kamm, J., ... & Batmagnai,
- 1330 E. (2018). Evidence for fluid and melt generation in response to an asthenospheric
- upwelling beneath the Hangai Dome, Mongolia. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 487,201–209.
- 1333 Constable, S., & Roberts, J. J. (1997). Simultaneous modeling of thermopower and electrical
- 1334 conduction in olivine. *Physics and Chemistry of Minerals, 24(5),* 319–325.
- 1335 Constable, S. (2006). SEO3: A new model of olivine electrical conductivity. *Geophysical*
- 1336 Journal International, 166(1), 435–437.
- 1337 Constable, S., Key, K., & Lewis, L. (2009). Mapping offshore sedimentary structure using
- electromagnetic methods and terrain effects in marine magnetotelluric data. *Geophysical Journal International*, 176(2), 431–442.
- 1340 Constable, S. (2013). Instrumentation for marine magnetotelluric and controlled source
- 1341 electromagnetic sounding. *Geophysical Prospecting*, *61*, 505–532.
- 1342 Constable, S., Orange, A., & Key, K. (2015). And the geophysicist replied: "Which model do 1343 you want?." *Geophysics, 80(3)*, E197–E212.
- 1344 Cox, C. S., Constable, S. C., Chave, A. D., & Webb, S. C. (1986). Controlled-source
- 1345 electromagnetic sounding of the oceanic lithosphere. *Nature*, *320*(6057), 52–54.
- 1346 Dai, L., & Karato, S.-I. (2009a). Electrical conductivity of pyrope-rich garnet at high
- temperature and high pressure. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 176(1-2), 83–
- 1348 **88**.

- 1349 Dai, L., & Karato, S.-I. (2009b). Electrical conductivity of orthopyroxene: Implications for
- the water content of the asthenosphere. *Proceedings of the Japan Academy, Series B*, 85(10),
- 1351 466-475.
- 1352 Dai, L., Li, H., Hu, H., & Hui, K. (2012). The effect of chemical composition and oxygen
- fugacity on the electrical conductivity of dry and hydrous garnet at high temperatures and
  pressures. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, *163*, 689–700.
- 1355 Dai, L., & Karato, S.-I. (2014). High and highly anisotropic electrical conductivity of the
- 1356 asthenosphere due to hydrogen diffusion in olivine. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*,
- 1357 *408*, 79–86.
- 1358 Dai, L., Hu, H., Jiang, J., Sun, W., Li, H., Wang, M., Vallianatos, F., & Saltas, V. (2020). An
- 1359 Overview of the Experimental Studies on the Electrical Conductivity of Major Minerals in
- 1360 the Upper Mantle and Transition Zone. *Materials*, *13*, 408.
- 1361 Dasgupta, R., Hirschmann, M. M., & Smith, N. D. (2007). Water follows carbon: CO2 incites
- deep silicate melting and dehydration beneath mid-ocean ridges. *Geology*, *35*(2), 135–138.
- de Groot-Hedlin, C. & Constable, S. (1990). Occam's inversion to generate smooth, two-
- dimensional models from magnetotelluric data. *Geophysics*, *55(12)*, 1613–1624.
- Demouchy, S. and Bolfan-Casanova, N. (2016). Distribution and transport of hydrogen in
  the lithospheric mantle: A review. *Lithos*, *240*, 402–425.
- 1367 Dohmen, R., & Milke, R. (2010). Diffusion in polycrystalline materials: grain boundaries,
- 1368 mathematical models, and experimental data. *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry*,
- 1369 *72*(1), 921–970.
- 1370 Dong, S. W., Li, T. D., Lü, Q. T., Gao, R., Yang, J. S., Chen, X. H., ... & Zhou, Q. (2013). Progress in
- 1371 deep lithospheric exploration of the continental China: A review of the
- 1372 SinoProbe. *Tectonophysics*, 606, 1–13.
- 1373 Du Frane, W. L., & Tyburczy, J. A. (2012). Deuterium-hydrogen exchange in olivine:
- 1374 Implications for point defects and electrical conductivity. *Geochemistry, Geophysics,*
- 1375 *Geosystems*, 13(3).
- 1376 Egbert, G. D., & Booker, J. R. (1986). Robust estimation of geomagnetic transfer
- 1377 functions. *Geophysical Journal International*, 87(1), 17–194.
- 1378 Egbert, G.D. (2011). Magnetotelluric Data Processing, in *Encyclopedia of Solid Earth*
- 1379 Geophysics, H.K. Gupta., Springer.
- 1380 Egbert, G. D., & Kelbert, A. (2012). Computational recipes for electromagnetic inverse
- 1381 problems. *Geophysical Journal International*, 189(1), 251–267.

- 1382 Evans, R. L., Hirth, G., Baba, K., Forsyth, D., Chave, A., & Mackie, R. (2005). Geophysical
- 1383 evidence from the MELT area for compositional controls on oceanic
- 1384 plates. *Nature*, *437*(7056), 249–252.
- 1385 Fei, H., Koizumi, S., Sakamoto, N., Hashiguchi, M., Yurimoto, H., Marquardt, K., et al. (2018).
- 1386 Mg lattice diffusion in iron-free olivine and implications to conductivity anomaly in the
- 1387 oceanic asthenosphere. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 484, 204–212.
- 1388 Fei, H., Druzhbin, D., & Katsura, T. (2020). The Effect of Water on Ionic Conductivity in
- 1389 Olivine. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *125*, e2019JB019313.
- 1390 Ferriss, E., Plank, T., & Walker, D. (2016). Site-specific hydrogen diffusion rates during
- 1391 clinopyroxene dehydration. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, 171(55).
- 1392 Forsyth, D. W., et al. (1998). Imaging the deep seismic structure beneath a mid-ocean ridge:
- 1393 The MELT experiment. *Science*, *280*(5367), 1215–1220.
- Frost, B. R. (1991). Introduction to oxygen fugacity and its petrologic importance. *Reviews in Mineralogy and Geochemistry*, *25*, 1–9.
- Frost, D. J., & McCammon, C. A. (2008). The redox state of Earth's mantle. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, *36*, 389–420.
- 1398 Fullea, J., Muller, M. R., & Jones, A. G. (2011). Electrical conductivity of continental
- 1399 lithospheric mantle from integrated geophysical and petrological modeling: Application to
- 1400 the Kaapvaal Craton and Rehoboth Terrane, southern Africa. *Journal of Geophysical*
- 1401 Research: Solid Earth, 116(B10).
- Gamble, T. D., Goubau, W. M., & Clarke, J. (1979). Magnetotellurics with a remote magnetic
  reference. *Geophysics*, 44(1), 53–68.
- Gardès, E., Gaillard, F., & Tarits, P. (2014). Toward a unified hydrous olivine electrical
  conductivity law. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, *15*(12), 4984–5000.
- 1406 Gardès, E., Laumonier, M., Massuyeau, M., & Gaillard, F. (2020). Unravelling partial melt
- 1407 distribution in the oceanic low velocity zone. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 540,1408 116242.
- 1409 Ghosh, D. B., & Karki, B. B. (2014). First principles simulations of the stability and structure
- 1410 of grain boundaries in Mg2SiO4 forsterite. *Physics and Chemistry of Minerals*, 41(3), 163–
- 1411 171.
- 1412 Glover, P. W., Hole, M. J., & Pous, J. (2000). A modified Archie's law for two conducting
- 1413 phases. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 180(3-4), 369–383.
- 1414 Glover, P. W. (2010). A generalized Archie's law for n phases. *Geophysics*, 75(6), E247–E265.

- 1415 Grandjean, A., Malki, M., Simonnet, C., Manara, D., & Penelon, B. (2007). Correlation
- 1416 between electrical conductivity, viscosity, and structure in borosilicate glass-forming melts.
- 1417 *Physical Review B*, 75(5), 054112.
- 1418 Griffin, W.L., O'reilly, S.Y., Afonso, J.C. and Begg, G.C. (2009). The composition and evolution
- 1419 of lithospheric mantle: a re-evaluation and its tectonic implications. *Journal of Petrology*, 1420 50(7) 1195 1204
- 1420 *50*(7), 1185–1204.
- Guo, H., & Keppler, H. (2019). Electrical conductivity of NaCl-bearing aqueous fluids to 900°
  C and 5 GPa. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *124*(2), 1397–1411.
- 1423 Hamilton, M. P., Jones, A. G., Evans, R. L., Evans, S., Fourie, C. J. S., Garcia, X., ... & SAMTEX MT
- 1424 Team. (2006). Electrical anisotropy of South African lithosphere compared with seismic
- 1425 anisotropy from shear-wave splitting analyses. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary*
- 1426 Interiors, 158(2-4), 226–239.
- 1427 Hansen, L. N., Zhao, Y. H., Zimmerman, M. E., & Kohlstedt, D. L. (2014). Protracted fabric
- 1428 evolution in olivine: Implications for the relationship among strain, crystallographic fabric,
- 1429 and seismic anisotropy. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 387, 157–168.
- 1430 Hashin, Z., & Shtrikman, S. (1962). A variational approach to the theory of the effective
- 1431 magnetic permeability of multiphase materials. *J. Appl. Phys.*, *33*, 3125–3131.
- 1432 Hasterok, D. (2013). A heat flow based cooling model for tectonic plates. *Earth and*
- 1433 Planetary Science Letters, 361, 34–43.
- 1434 Hauri, E. H., Gaetani, G. A., & Green, T. H. (2006). Partitioning of water during melting of the
- Earth's upper mantle at H2O-undersaturated conditions. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 248*(3-4), 715-734.
- 1437 Heise, W., Caldwell, T. G., Bannister, S., Bertrand, E. A., Ogawa, Y., Bennie, S. L., & Ichihara, H.
- 1438 (2017). Mapping subduction interface coupling using magnetotellurics: Hikurangi margin,
- 1439 New Zealand. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 44(18), 9261-9266.
- 1440 Hirsch, L. M., & Shankland, T. J. (1993). Quantitative olivine-defect chemical model: insights
- on electrical conduction, diffusion, and the role of Fe content. *Geophysical Journal International*, *114*(1), 21–35.
- 1443 Hirschmann, M. M. (2000). Mantle solidus: Experimental constraints and the effects of
- 1444 peridotite composition. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems,* 1(10).
- 1445 Hirschmann, M. M. (2006). Water, melting, and the deep Earth H2O cycle. *Annu. Rev. Earth* 1446 *Planet. Sci., 34*, 629–653.
- 1447 Hirschmann, M. M., Tenner, T., Aubaud, C., & Withers, A. C. (2009). Dehydration melting of
- 1448 nominally anhydrous mantle: The primacy of partitioning. *Physics of the Earth and*
- 1449 Planetary Interiors, 176(1-2), 54–68.

- 1450 Hirschmann, M. M. (2010). Partial melt in the oceanic low velocity zone. *Physics of the Earth* 1451 *and Planetary Interiors*, *179*(1-2), 60–71.
- 1452 Hirth, G., & Kohlstedt, D. L. (1996). Water in the oceanic upper mantle: implications for
- 1453 rheology, melt extraction and the evolution of the lithosphere. *Earth and Planetary Science*
- 1454 *Letters, 144(1),* 93–108.
- 1455 Hirth, G., & Kohlstedf, D. (2003). Rheology of the upper mantle and the mantle wedge: A
- view from the experimentalists. *GEOPHYSICAL MONOGRAPH-AMERICAN GEOPHYSICAL UNION*, *138*, 83–106.
- 1458 Hole, M. J. (2015). The generation of continental flood basalts by decompression melting of
- 1459 internally heated mantle. *Geology*, 43(4), 311–314. doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1130/G36442.1</u>
- 1460 Holzapfel, W. B. (1969). Effect of pressure and temperature on the conductivity and ionic
- 1461 dissociation of water up to 100 kbar and 1000 C. *The Journal of Chemical Physics*, *50*(10),
- 1462 4424-4428.
- 1463 Jackson, I., & Faul, U. H. (2010). Grainsize-sensitive viscoelastic relaxation in olivine:
- 1464 Towards a robust laboratory-based model for seismological application. *Physics of the*
- 1465 *Earth and Planetary Interiors, 183*(1-2), 151–163.
- 1466 Jain, C., Korenaga, J, & Karato, S. (2019). Global analysis of experimental data on the
- 1467 rheology of olivine aggregates. *JGR: Solid Earth*, 124, 310–334.
- 1468 Jarrard, R. D. (2003). Subduction fluxes of water, carbon dioxide, chlorine, and
- 1469 potassium. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems,* 4(5).
- Jaupart, C., Mareschal, J.C. and Watts, A.B. (2007). Heat flow and thermal structure of the
  lithosphere. *Treatise on geophysics*, *6*, 217–252.
- 1472 Johansen, S. E., Panzner, M., Mittet, R., Amundsen, H. E., Lim, A., Vik, E., et al. (2019). Deep
- 1473 electrical imaging of the ultraslow-spreading Mohns Ridge. *Nature*, *567*(7748), 379–383.
- 1474 Jones, A.G. and Ferguson, I.J. (2001). The electric moho. *Nature*, 409(6818), p.331.
- I475 Jones, A.G., Lezaeta, P., Ferguson, I.J., Chave, A.D., Evans, R.L., Garcia, X. and Spratt, J. (2003).
- 1476 The electrical structure of the Slave craton. *Lithos*, *71*(2-4), 505–527.
- 1477 Jones, A.G., Ledo, J., Ferguson, I.J., Farquharson, C., Garcia, X., Grant, N., McNeice, G., Roberts,
- 1478 B., Spratt, J., Wennberg, G. and Wolynec, L. (2005). The electrical resistivity structure of
- 1479 Archean to Tertiary lithosphere along 3200 km of SNORCLE profiles, northwestern Canada.
- 1480 Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences, 42(6), 1257–1275.
- 1481 Jones, A.G., Evans, R.L., Muller, M.R., Hamilton, M.P., Miensopust, M.P., Garcia, X., Cole, P.,
- 1482 Ngwisanyi, T., Hutchins, D., Fourie, C.J.S. and Jelsma, H. (2009). Area selection for diamonds
- 1483 using magnetotellurics: Examples from southern Africa. *Lithos*, *112*, 83–92.

- 1484 Jones, A. G., Fullea, J., Evans, R. L., & Muller, M. R. (2012). Water in cratonic lithosphere:
- 1485 Calibrating laboratory-determined models of electrical conductivity of mantle minerals
- 1486 using geophysical and petrological observations. *Geochemistry, Geophysics,*
- 1487 Geosystems, 13(6).
- 1488 Jones, A. (2012). Distortion of magnetotelluric data: Its identification and removal. In A.
- 1489 Chave & A. Jones (Eds.), *The Magnetotelluric Method: Theory and Practice* (pp. 219–302).
- 1490 Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- 1491 Jones, A. G. (2016). Proton conduction and hydrogen diffusion in olivine: an attempt to
- reconcile laboratory and field observations and implications for the role of grain boundary diffusion in enhancing conductivity. *Physics and Chemistry of Minerals*, 43(4), 237–265.
- Karato, S.-i. (1990). The role of hydrogen in the electrical conductivity of the upper mantle. *Nature*, 347(6290), 272–273.
- 1496 Karato, S.-i. (2013). Theory of isotope diffusion in a material with multiple species and its
- 1497 implications for hydrogen-enhanced electrical conductivity in olivine. *Physics of the Earth*
- 1498 and Planetary Interiors, 219, 49–54.
- 1499 Karato, S.-i. (2015). Some notes on hydrogen-related point defects and their role in the
- 1500 isotope exchange and electrical conductivity in olivine. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary*
- 1501 Interiors, 248, 94–98.
- 1502 Karato, S.-i., Olugboji, T., & Park, J. (2015). Mechanisms and geologic significance of the mid-
- 1503 lithosphere discontinuity in the continents. *Nature Geoscience*, 8, 509–514.
- 1504 Katsura, T., Yoneda, A., Yamazaki, D., Yoshino, T. and Ito, E. (2010). Adiabatic temperature
- 1505 profile in the mantle. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 183(1-2), 212–218.
- 1506 Kawakatsu, H., & Utada, H. (2017). Seismic and electrical signatures of the lithosphere-
- asthenosphere system of the normal oceanic mantle. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 45.
- 1509 Kelbert, A., Meqbel, N., Egbert, G. D., & Tandon, K. (2014). ModEM: A modular system for
- 1510 inversion of electromagnetic geophysical data. *Computers & Geosciences, 66,* 40–53.
- 1511 Kelley, K. A., Cottrell, E., & Le Voyer, M. (2019). Water Content of MORBs and the Oceanic
- 1512 Upper Mantle. AGU-FM, 2019, V51I-0163.
- 1513 Key, K., & Constable, S. (2002). Broadband marine MT exploration of the East Pacific Rise at 1514 9° 50' N. *Geophysical Research Letters*, *29*(22), 11-1.
- 1515 Key, K., Constable, S., Matsuno, T., Evans, R. L., & Myer, D. (2012). Electromagnetic detection
- 1516 of plate hydration due to bending faults at the Middle America Trench. *Earth and Planetary*
- 1517 Science Letters, 351-352, 45–53.

- 1518 Key, K., Constable, S., Liu, L., & Pommier, A. (2013). Electrical image of passive mantle
- 1519 upwelling beneath the northern East Pacific Rise. *Nature*, *495*(7442), 499–502.
- 1520 Key, K. (2016). MARE2DEM: a 2-D inversion code for controlled-source electromagnetic
- and magnetotelluric data. *Geophysical Journal International*, 207(1), 571–588.
- 1522 Khan, A. (2016). On Earth's mantle constitution and structure from joint analysis of
- 1523 geophysical and laboratory-based data: An example. *Surveys in Geophysics*, *37*(1), 149–189.
- 1524 Kohlstedt, D. L., & Mackwell, S. J. (1998). Diffusion of Hydrogen and Intrinsic Point Defects
- 1525 in Olivine. Zeitschrift Für Physikalische Chemie, 207, 147–162.
- 1526 Laumonier, M., Gaillard, F., & Sifre, D. (2015). The effect of pressure and water
- 1527 concentration on the electrical conductivity of dacitic melts: Implication for
- 1528 magnetotelluric imaging in subduction areas. *Chemical Geology*, 418, 66–76.
- 1529 Laumonier, M., Farla, R., Frost, D. J., Katsura, T., Marquardt, K., Bouvier, A. S., &
- 1530 Baumgartner, L. P. (2017). Experimental determination of melt interconnectivity and

1531 electrical conductivity in the upper mantle. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 463, 286–

- 1532 297.
- 1533 Li, Z.-X. A., Lee, C.-T. A., Peslier, A. H., Lenardic, A., & Mackwell, S. J. (2008). Water contents
- 1534 in mantle xenoliths from the Colorado Plateau and vicinity: Implications for the mantle
- 1535 rheology and hydration-induced thinning of continental lithosphere. J. Geophys. Res., 113,
- 1536 B09210.
- 1537 Libowitzky, E., & Rossman, G. R. (1996). Principles of quantitative absorbance
- 1538 measurements in anisotropic crystals. *Physics and Chemistry of Minerals*, *23*(6), 319–327.
- Liu, L., & Hasterok, D. (2016). High-resolution lithosphere viscosity and dynamics revealed
  by magnetotelluric imaging. *Science*, *353*(6307), 1515–1519.
- 1541 Marquardt, K., Rohrer, G. S., Morales, L., Rybacki, E., Marquardt, H., & Lin, B. (2015). The
- 1542 most frequent interfaces in olivine aggregates: the GBCD and its importance for grain
- boundary related processes. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, 170(4), 40.
- 1544 McHone, J.G. (2000). Non-plume magmatism and rifting during the opening of the central
- 1545 Atlantic Ocean. *Tectonophysics*, 316(3–4), 287–296.
- 1546 Meqbel, N.M., Egbert, G.D., Wannamaker, P.E., Kelbert, A. and Schultz, A. (2014). Deep
- 1547 electrical resistivity structure of the northwestern US derived from 3-D inversion of
- 1548 USArray magnetotelluric data. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *402*, 290-304.
- 1549 McGary, R. S., Evans, R. L., Wannamaker, P. E., Elsenbeck, J., & Rondenay, S. (2014). Pathway
- 1550 from subducting slab to surface for melt and fluids beneath Mount
- 1551 Rainier. *Nature*, *511*(7509), 338–340.

- 1552 Miller, K. J., Montési, L. G., & Zhu, W. (2015). Estimates of olivine-basaltic melt electrical
- 1553 conductivity using a digital rock physics approach. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 432, 1554 232 241
- 1554 332-341.
- 1555 Misener, D. J. (1974). Cationic diffusion in olivine to 1400°C and 35 kbar, in *Geochemical*
- 1556 *Transport and Kinetics*, edited by A. W. Hofmann et al., 117–129, Carnegie Institution of
- 1557 Washington, Washington, D. C.
- Mott, N. F., & Gurney, R. W. (1948). Ch 2 in *Electronic processes in ionic crystals*, 2nd edn.
  Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- 1560 Müller, A., & Haak, V. (2004). 3-D modeling of the deep electrical conductivity of Merapi
- 1561 volcano (Central Java): integrating magnetotellurics, induction vectors and the effects of
- steep topography. *Journal of volcanology and geothermal research*, 138(3-4), 205–222.
- 1563 Murphy, B. S., & Egbert, G. D. (2017). Electrical conductivity structure of southeastern
- 1564 North America: Implications for lithospheric architecture and Appalachian topographic
- 1565 rejuvenation. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 462, 66–75.
- 1566 Murphy, B. S., & Egbert, G. D. (2018). Source biases in midlatitude magnetotelluric transfer 1567 functions due to Pc3-4 geomagnetic pulsations. *Earth, Planets and Space*, *70*(1), 12.
- 1568 Murphy, B.S., Egbert, G. (2019). Synthesizing Seemingly Contradictory Seismic and
- 1569 Magnetotelluric Observations in the Southeastern United States to Image Physical
- 1570 Properties of the Lithosphere. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems*, 20(6), 2606–2625.
- 1571 Naif, S., Key, K., Constable, S., & Evans, R. L. (2013). Melt-rich channel observed at the
- 1572 lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary. *Nature*, 495(7441), 356–359.
- Naif, S., Key, K., Constable, S., & Evans, R. L. (2015). Water-rich bending faults at the Middle
  America Trench. *Geochemistry Geophysics Geosystems*, 16(8), 2582–2597.
- 1575 Naif, S. (2018). An upper bound on the electrical conductivity of hydrated oceanic mantle at
- 1576 the onset of dehydration melting. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 482, 357–366.
- Nesbitt, B. E. (1993). Electrical resistivities of crustal fluids. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *98*(B3), 4301–4310.
- 1579 Ni, H., Keppler, H., & Behrens, H. (2011). Electrical conductivity of hydrous basaltic melts:
- 1580 implications for partial melting in the upper mantle. *Contributions to Mineralogy and*
- 1581 *Petrology*, *162*(3), 637–650.
- Ni, H., Hui, H., & Steinle-Neumann, G. (2015). Transport properties of silicate melts. *Reviews*of Geophysics, 53(3), 715–744.
- 1584 Novella, D., Jacobsen, B., Weber, P. K., Tyburczy, J. A., Ryerson, F. J., & Frane, Du, W. L.
- 1585 (2017). Hydrogen self-diffusion in single crystal olivine and electrical conductivity of the
- 1586 Earth's mantle. *Scientific Reports*, 7(1).

- 1587 O'Leary, J. A., Gaetani, G. A., & Hauri, E. H. (2010). The effect of tetrahedral Al3+ on the
- 1588 partitioning of water between clinopyroxene and silicate melt. *Earth and Planetary Science*
- 1589 *Letters*, 297(1-2), 111–120.
- 1590 Özaydın, S., & Selway, K. (2020). MATE: An Analysis Tool for the Interpretation of
- 1591 Magnetotelluric Models of the Mantle. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 21*(9), e2020GC009126.
- 1593 Padilha, A.L., Vitorello, Í., Pádua, M.B. and Bologna, M.S. (2006). Lithospheric and
- 1594 sublithospheric anisotropy beneath central-southeastern Brazil constrained by long period
- 1595 magnetotelluric data. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, *158*(2–4), 190–209.
- 1596 Paterson, M. (1982). The determination of hydroxyl by infrared absorption in quartz,
- 1597 silicate glasses and similar materials. *Bulletin de minéralogie*, *105*(1), 20–29.
- 1598 Peacock, J. R., & Selway, K. (2016). Magnetotelluric investigation of the Vestfold Hills and
- Rauer Group, East Antarctica. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 121(4), 2258–2273.
- 1601 Persikov, E. S., Bukhtiyarov, P. G., & Sokol, A. G. (2017). Viscosity of hydrous kimberlite and 1602 basaltic melts at high pressures. *Russian Geology and Geophysics*, *58*(9), 1093–1100.
- 1603 Poe, B. T., Romano, C., Nestola, F., & Smyth, J. R. (2010). Electrical conductivity anisotropy of
- dry and hydrous olivine at 8GPa. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 181(3–4)*,
  103–111.
- 1606 Pollitz, F. F., & Mooney, W. D. (2016). Seismic velocity structure of the crust and shallow
- 1607 mantle of the Central and Eastern United States by seismic surface wave imaging.1608 *Geophysical Research Letters*, 43, 118–126.
- 1609 Pommier, A., Gaillard, F., Malki, M., & Pichavant, M. (2010). Methodological re-evaluation of
- 1610 the electrical conductivity of silicate melts. *American Mineralogist*, 95(2-3), 284–291.
- 1611 Pommier, A., Evans, R. L., Key, K., Tyburczy, J. A., Mackwell, S., & Elsenbeck, J. (2013).
- 1612 Prediction of silicate melt viscosity from electrical conductivity: A model and its
- 1613 geophysical implications. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems,* 14(6), 1685–1692.
- 1614 Pommier, A. (2014). Interpretation of magnetotelluric results using laboratory
- 1615 measurements. *Surveys in Geophysics*, 35(1), 41–84.
- 1616 Pommier, A., Leinenweber, K., Kohlstedt, D. L., Qi, C., Garnero, E. J., Mackwell, S. J., &
- 1617 Tyburczy, J. A. (2015). Experimental constraints on the electrical anisotropy of the
- 1618 lithosphere–asthenosphere system. *Nature*, *522*(7555), 202–206.
- 1619 Pommier, A., Kohlstedt, D. L., Hansen, L. N., Mackwell, S., Tasaka, M., Heidelbach, F., &
- 1620 Leinenweber, K. (2018). Transport properties of olivine grain boundaries from electrical
- 1621 conductivity experiments. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, 173(5), 41.

- 1622 Quist, A. S., & Marshall, W. L. (1968). Electrical conductances of aqueous sodium chloride
- solutions from 0 to 800 degrees and at pressures to 4000 bars. *The Journal of Physical*
- 1624 *Chemistry*, 72(2), 684–703.
- 1625 Rai, C. S., & Manghnani, M. H. (1977). Electrical conductivity of basalts to 1550C. In: Dick,
- 1626 H.J.B. (Ed.), *Magma Genesis Bull. 96*, Oregon Dept. Geol. Miner. Ind., Portland, pp. 219–237.
- 1627 Reynes, J., Jollands, M., Hermann, J., & Ireland, T. (2018). Experimental constraints on
- 1628 hydrogen diffusion in garnet. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, 173(69).
- 1629 Roberts, J. J., & Tyburczy, J. A. (1991). Frequency dependent electrical properties of
- 1630 polycrystalline olivine compacts. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, 96(B10),
- 1631 16205–16222.
- 1632 Roberts, J. J., & Tyburczy, J. A. (1993). Impedance Spectroscopy of Single and Polycrystalline
- 1633 Olivine: Evidence for Grain Boundary Transport. *Physics and chemistry of minerals, 20,* 19–
  1634 26.
- 1635 Robertson, K., Heinson, G., & Thiel, S. (2016). Lithospheric reworking at the Proterozoic–
- 1636 Phanerozoic transition of Australia imaged using AusLAMP Magnetotelluric data. *Earth and*
- 1637 Planetary Science Letters, 452, 27–35.
- 1638 Robertson, K., Thiel, S., & Meqbel, N. (2020). Quality over quantity: on workflow and model
- space exploration of 3D inversion of MT data. *Earth, Planets and Space, 72*(1), 1–22.
- Rodi, W. L., & Mackie, R. L. (2012). The inverse problem. *The Magnetotelluric Method: Theory and Practice*, 347–414.
- 1642 Romano, C., Poe, B. T., Kreidie, N., & McCammon, C. A. (2006). Electrical conductivities of
- pyrope-almandine garnets up to 19 GPa and 1700 C. *American Mineralogist*, 91(8–9), 1371–1377.
- 1645 Saal, A. E., Hauri, E. H., Langmuir, C. H., & Perfit, M. R. (2002). Vapour undersaturation in
- 1646 primitive mid-ocean-ridge basalt and the volatile content of Earth's upper
- 1647 mantle. *Nature*, 419(6906), 451–455.
- 1648 Sappa, G., Ergul, S., & Ferranti, F. (2014). Water quality assessment of carbonate aquifers in
- southern Latium region, Central Italy: a case study for irrigation and drinking purposes. *Appl Water Sci*, 4, 115–128.
- 1651 Sarafian, E., Evans, R. L., Collins, J. A., Elsenbeck, J., Gaetani, G. A., Gaherty, J. B., Hirth, G., &
- 1652 Lizarralde, D. (2015). The electrical structure of the central Pacific upper mantle
- 1653 constrained by the NoMelt experiment. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 16(4), 1115-
- 1654 1132.

- 1655 Schlechter, E., Stalder, R., & Behrens, H. (2012). Electrical conductivity of H-bearing
- 1656 orthopyroxene single crystals measured with impedance spectroscopy. *Physics and*
- 1657 *Chemistry of Minerals*, *39*(7), 531–541.
- 1658 Schmandt, B., & Lin, F.-C. (2014). P and S wave tomography of the mantle beneath the
- 1659 United States. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 41, 6342–6349.
- 1660 Schock, R. N. & Duba, A. G. (1985). Points Defects and the Mechanisms of Electrical
- 1661 Conduction in Olivine. *Point Defects in Minerals*, 88–96.
- Schock, R. N., Duba, A. G., & Shankland, T. J. (1989). Electrical conduction in olivine. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, *94(B5)*, 5829–5839.
- 1664 Seifert, K.F., Will, G., & Voigt, R. (1982) Electrical conductivity measurements on synthetic
- 1665 pyroxenes MgSiO3-FeSiO3 at high pressures and temperatures under defined
- 1666 thermodynamic conditions. In W. Schreyer, Ed., *High-pressure Researches in Geoscience*,
- 1667 419–432. Schweizerbart'sche, Stuttgart.
- Selway, K. (2015). Negligible effect of hydrogen content on plate strength in East Africa. *Nature Geoscience*, 8(7), 543–546.
- 1670 Selway, K., Ford, H. and Kelemen, P. (2015). The seismic mid-lithosphere discontinuity.
- 1671 Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 414, 45–57.
- 1672 Selway, K. (2018). Electrical discontinuities in the continental lithosphere imaged with 1673 magnetotellurics. *Lithospheric Discontinuities*, 89–109.
- Selway, K., & O'Donnell, J. P. (2019). A small, unextractable melt fraction as the cause for the
  low velocity zone. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, *517*, 117–124.
- 1676 Selway, K., O'Donnell, J. P., & Özaydin, S. (2019). Upper mantle melt distribution from
- petrologically constrained magnetotellurics. *Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 20*(7),3328–3346.
- 1679 Selway, K., Smirnov, M. Y., Beka, T., O'Donnell, J. P., Minakov, A., Senger, K., ... & Kalscheuer,
- 1680 T. (2020). Magnetotelluric Constraints on the Temperature, Composition, Partial Melt
- 1681 Content, and Viscosity of the Upper Mantle Beneath Svalbard. Geochemistry, Geophysics,
- 1682 *Geosystems*, *21*(5), e2020GC008985.
- 1683 Shankland, T. J., & Duba, A. G. (1990). Standard electrical conductivity of isotropic,
- homogeneous olivine in the temperature range 1200–1500 C. *Geophysical Journal International*, *103*(1), 25–31.
- 1686 Shellnutt, J. G., Dostal, J., & Yeh, M. W. (2018). Mantle source heterogeneity of the Early
- 1687 Jurassic basalt of eastern North America. International Journal of Earth Sciences, 107(3),
- 1688 1033-1058.

- 1689 Sifré, D., Gardés, E., Massuyeau, M., Hashim, L., Hier-Majumder, S., & Gaillard, F. (2014).
- 1690 Electrical conductivity during incipient melting in the oceanic low-velocity
- 1691 zone. Nature, 509(7498), 81–85.
- 1692 Sim, S. J., Spiegelman, M., Stegman, D. R., & Wilson, C. (2020). The influence of spreading
- 1693 rate and permeability on melt focusing beneath mid-ocean ridges. *Physics of the Earth and* 1694 *Planetary Interiors*, *304*, 106486.
- 1695 Simpson, F., & Bahr, K. (2005). *Practical magnetotellurics*. Cambridge University Press.
- Singh, D. K., Singh, R. P., & Kamra, A. K. (2004). The electrical environment of the Earth's
  atmosphere: A review. *Space Science Reviews*, *113*(3), 375–408.
- 1698 Sinmyo, R., & Keppler, H. (2017). Electrical conductivity of NaCl-bearing aqueous fluids to
- 1699 600° C and 1 GPa. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, 172(1), 4.
- 1700 Siripunvaraporn, W., Egbert, G., Lenbury, Y., & Uyeshima, M. (2005). Three-dimensional
- 1701 magnetotelluric inversion: data-space method. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary*
- 1702 Interiors, 150(1-3), 3–14.
- 1703 Smyth, D. M., & Stocker, R. L. (1975). Point defects and non-stoichiometry in 1704 forsterite. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, *10*(2), 183–192.
- 1705 Stachel, T., Brey, G. P., & Harris, J. W. (2005). Inclusions in sublithospheric diamonds: 1706 glimpses of deep Earth. *Elements*, *1*(2), 73–78.
- 1707 Sun, W., Yoshino, T., Kuroda, M., Sakamoto, N., & Yurimoto, H. (2019). H–D interdiffusion in
- 1708 single crystal olivine: implications for electrical conductivity in the upper mantle. *Journal of*
- 1709 Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 2019JB017576–12.
- 1710 Ten Grotenhuis, S. M., Drury, M. R., Spiers, C. J., & Peach, C. J. (2005). Melt distribution in
- 1711 olivine rocks based on electrical conductivity measurements. *Journal of Geophysical*1712 *Research: Solid Earth*, *110*(B12).
- 1713 Thiel, S., Heinson, G. and White, A. (2005). Tectonic evolution of the southern Gawler
- 1714 Craton, South Australia, from electromagnetic sounding. *Australian Journal of Earth*
- 1715 Sciences, 52(6), 887–896.
- 1716 Tyburczy, J. A., & Waff, H. S. (1983). Electrical conductivity of molten basalt and andesite to
- 1717 25 kilobars pressure: Geophysical significance and implications for charge transport and
- 1718 melt structure. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 88(B3), 2413–2430.
- 1719 Tyburczy, J. A., & Fisler, D. K. (1995). Electrical properties of minerals and melts. *Mineral*
- 1720 *physics and crystallography, a handbook of physical constants,* 185–208.
- 1721 Vozoff, K. (1991). The magnetotelluric method. In *Electromagnetic Methods in Applied*
- 1722 *Geophysics: Volume 2, Application, Parts A and B* (pp. 641-712). Society of Exploration
- 1723 Geophysicists.

- 1724 Wagner, L. S., Fischer, K. M., Hawman, R., Hopper, E., & Howell, D. (2018). The relative roles
- 1725 of inheritance and long-term passive margin lithospheric evolution on the modern
- structure and tectonic activity in the southeastern United States. *Geosphere*, 14(4), 1385–1410.
- Wang, D., Mookherjee, M., Xu, Y., & Karato, S.-i. (2006). The effect of water on the electrical
  conductivity of olivine. *Nature*, 443(7114), 977–980.
- 1730 Wang, D., Li, H., Yi, L., Matsuzaki, T. and Yoshino, T. (2010). Anisotropy of synthetic quartz
- 1731 electrical conductivity at high pressure and temperature. *Journal of Geophysical Research:*
- 1732 Solid Earth, 115(B9).
- 1733 Wang, D., Guo, Y., Yu, Y. and Karato, S.I. (2012). Electrical conductivity of amphibole-bearing
- 1734 rocks: influence of dehydration. *Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology*, *164*(1), 17–25.
- 1735 Wannamaker, P. E. (2000). Comment on "The petrologic case for a dry lower crust" by
- 1736 Bruce WD Yardley and John W. Valley. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 105(B3),
- 1737 6057–6064.
- 1738 Wannamaker, P. E., Hasterok, D. P., Johnston, J. M., Stodt, J. A., Hall, D. B., Sodergren, T. L., et
- al. (2008). Lithospheric dismemberment and magmatic processes of the Great Basin–
- 1740 Colorado Plateau transition, Utah, implied from magnetotellurics. *Geochemistry, Geophysics,*
- 1741 *Geosystems*, 9(5).
- 1742 Wannamaker, P., Hill, G., Stodt, J., Maris, V., Ogawa, Y., Selway, K., Boren, G., Bertrand, E.,
- 1743 Uhlmann, D., Ayling, B. and Green, A.M. (2017). Uplift of the central transantarctic
- 1744 mountains. *Nature communications*, 8(1).
- Watson, B. (2002). Mobility of siderophile elements in grain boundaries of periclase andpericlase/olivine aggregates. AGU-SM, 2002, V52B-05.
- Waxman, M. H., & Smits, L. J. M. (1968). Electrical conductivities in oil-bearing shaly
  sands. *Society of Petroleum Engineers Journal*, 8(02), 107–122.
- 1749 Whalen, L., Gazel, E., Vidito, C., Puffer, J., Bizimis, M., Henika, W., and Caddick, M. J. (2015).
- 1750 Supercontinental inheritance and its influence on supercontinental breakup: The Central
- 1751 Atlantic Magmatic Province and the break up of Pangea, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, 16,
- 1752 3532-3554. doi:10.1002/2015GC005885.
- 1753 White, R. S., McKenzie, D., & O'Nions, R. K. (1992). Oceanic crustal thickness from seismic
- 1754 measurements and rare earth element inversions. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid*
- 1755 Earth, 97(B13), 19683–19715.
- 1756 Whittall, K. P., & Oldenburg, D. W. (1992). Inversion of magnetotelluric data for a one-
- 1757 *dimensional conductivity*. Society of Exploration Geophysicists.

- 1758 Wilson, C. R., Spiegelman, M., van Keken, P. E., & Hacker, B. R. (2014). Fluid flow in
- 1759 subduction zones: The role of solid rheology and compaction pressure. *Earth and Planetary*
- 1760 Science Letters, 401, 261–274.
- 1761 Worzewski, T., Jegen, M., Kopp, H., Brasse, H., & Castillo, W. T. (2011). Magnetotelluric
- image of the fluid cycle in the Costa Rican subduction zone. *Nature Geoscience*, 4(2), 108–111.
- 1764 Wunderman, R. L., Wannamaker, P. E., & Young, C. T. (2018). Architecture of the hidden
- 1765 Penokean terrane suture and Midcontinent rift system overprint in eastern Minnesota and
- 1766 western Wisconsin from magnetotelluric profiling. *Lithosphere*, *10*(2), 291–300.
- 1767 Xu, Y., Shankland, T. J. & Duba, A. G. (2000). Pressure effect on electrical conductivity of 1768 mantle olivine. *Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors*, *118*, 149–161.
- 1769 Xu, Y., Zhang, A., Yang, B., Bao, X., Wang, Q., Xia, J., & Yang, W. (2018). Bridging the
- 1770 connection between effective viscosity and electrical conductivity through water content in
- 1771 the upper mantle. *Scientific reports*, *8*(1), 1–8.
- 1772 Yang, B., Egbert, G.D., Kelbert, A. and Meqbel, N.M. (2015). Three-dimensional electrical
- 1773 resistivity of the north-central USA from EarthScope long period magnetotelluric data.
  1774 *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 422, 87–93.
- 1775 Yang, X., Keppler, H., McCammon, C., Ni, H., Xia, Q. and Fan, Q. (2011). Effect of water on the
- 1776 electrical conductivity of lower crustal clinopyroxene. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid
- 1777 Earth, 116(B4).
- 1778 Yang, X., Keppler, H., McCammon, C. and Ni, H. (2012). Electrical conductivity of
- 1779 orthopyroxene and plagioclase in the lower crust. *Contributions to Mineralogy and*
- 1780 *Petrology*, *163*(1), 33-48.
- 1781 Yardley, B. W., & Valley, J. W. (1997). The petrologic case for a dry lower crust. *Journal of*
- 1782 *Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 102*(B6), 12173–12185.
- 1783 Yardley, B. W. D., & Valley, J. W. (2000). Reply [to "Comment on 'The petrologic case for a
- dry lower crust'by Bruce WD Yardley and John W. Valley"]. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth*, *105*(B3), 6065–6068.
- 1765 Solid Lardi, 105(155), 0005 0000.
- 1786 Yoshino, T., Matsuzaki, T., Yamashita, S., & Katsura, T. (2006). Hydrous olivine unable to
- account for conductivity anomaly at the top of the asthenosphere. *Nature*, 443(7114), 973–976.
- 1789 Yoshino, T., Matsuzaki, T., Shatskiy, A., & Katsura, T. (2009). The effect of water on the
- 1790 electrical conductivity of olivine aggregates and its implications for the electrical structure
- 1791 of the upper mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 288(1-2), 291–300.

- 1792 Yoshino, T., & Katsura, T. (2009). Effect of iron content on electrical conductivity of
- 1793 ringwoodite, with implications for electrical structure in the transition zone. *Physics of the*
- 1794 *Earth and Planetary Interiors*, 174(1-4), 3–9.
- 1795 Yoshino, T. (2010). Laboratory Electrical Conductivity Measurement of Mantle Minerals.
- 1796 *Surveys in Geophysics*, 31(2), 163–206.
- 1797 Yoshino, T., Laumonier, M., McIsaac, E., & Katsura, T. (2010). Electrical conductivity of
- 1798 basaltic and carbonatite melt-bearing peridotites at high pressures: implications for melt
- distribution and melt fraction in the upper mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 295,593–602.
- 1801 Yoshino, T., & Katsura, T. (2013). Electrical Conductivity of Mantle Minerals: Role of Water
- 1802 in Conductivity Anomalies. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences*, 41(1), 605–628.
- 1803 Yoshino, T., Zhang, B., Rhymer, B., Zhao, C., & Fei, H. (2017). Pressure dependence of
- 1804 electrical conductivity in forsterite. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 122(1),*
- 1805 158–171.
- Yoshino, T. (2018). Electrical Conductivity Measurement. In *Magmas Under Pressure* (pp. 281–319). Elsevier. <u>http://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-811301-1.00011-3</u>
- 1808 Zhang, B., Yoshino, T., Wu, X., Matsuzaki, T., & Shan, S. (2012). Electrical conductivity of
- 1809 enstatite as a function of water content: Implications for the electrical structure in the
- 1810 upper mantle. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 447, 1–9.
- 1811 Zhang, B., Yoshino, T., Yamazaki, D., Manthilake, G., & Katsura, T. (2014). Electrical
- 1812 conductivity anisotropy in partially molten peridotite under shear deformation. *Earth and*
- 1813 Planetary Science Letters, 405, 98–109.
- 1814 Zhao, C., & Yoshino, T. (2016). Electrical conductivity of mantle clinopyroxene as a function
- 1815 of water content and its implication on electrical structure of uppermost mantle. *Earth and*
- 1816 Planetary Science Letters, 447, 1–9.
- 1817 Zhu, W., Gaetani, G. A., Fusseis, F., Montési, L. G., & De Carlo, F. (2011). Microtomography of
- 1818 partially molten rocks: three-dimensional melt distribution in mantle peridotite.
- 1819 Science, 332(6025), 88–91.